Pg. No.

#### DARTMOOR NATIONAL PARK AUTHORITY

#### DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE

## 29 July 2022

#### Applications to be Determined by the Committee

#### Report of the Head of Development Management

INDEX

#### Item No. Description

#### 1. 0056/22 Installation of 30m lattice tower supporting 6 antennas, 4 transmission 11 dishes, 2 equipment cabinets, 1 meter cabinet and ancillary development thereto including a generator and associated fuel tank, a hard standing area and a 2.4m fenced compound for the Shared Rural Network project. Land at Blackingstone Wood, Doccombe 2. 0073/22 Installation of 35m lattice tower supporting 6 antennas, 4 transmission 19 dishes, 2 equipment cabinets and ancillary development including generator and associated fuel tank, a hard standing area, fenced compound and gabion wall. Land at Snider Park Plantation, Dartmeet 0189/22 3. 29 Change of use from a residential care home to education use with associated external alterations. Heatherside House, Princetown Road, Dousland, Yelverton 0179/22 4. Installation of vertical slate rainscreen cladding to south elevation 40 Challacombe Farm, Widecombe-in-the-Moor 0182/22 5. Replacement extension and outbuildings 44 **Ingsdon View, Liverton** 6. 0205/22 Change of use of shop, cafe and post office counter to residential 50 accommodation as part of the existing dwelling The Stores, South Zeal 7. 0206/22 Works to facilitate a change of use of shop, cafe and post office counter 59 to residential accommodation as part of the existing dwelling

The Stores, South Zeal (Listed Building Consent)

# **Dartmoor National Park Authority**

0056/22 - Blackingstone Wood - SRN

Scale 1:1,807

Map created by ptwamley on 21/4/2022



# Applications for Determination by the Committee

Item 1

Application No:	0056/22	District/Borough:	Teignbridge	
Application Type:	Full Planning Permission	Parish:	Bridford	
Grid ref:	SX79008530	Officer:	Christopher Hart	
Proposal:	Installation of 30m lattice tower supporting 6 no. antennas, 4 no. transmission dishes, 2 no. equipment cabinets, 1 no. meter cabinet and ancillary development thereto including a generator and associated fuel tank, a hard standing area, and a 2.4m fenced compound for the Shared Rural Network project.			
Location:	Land at Blackingstone Wood, Doccombe			
Applicant:	Cornerstone, c/o agent Clarke Telecom Limited			
Recommendation:	That permission be GRANTED			

#### Conditions:

- 1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.
- 2. The development hereby approved, shall be carried out strictly in accordance with the approved Site Location Plan (100B), and drawings Detailed Site Location (101B), Proposed Site Plan (201B), and Proposed Site Elevation (301B), valid 9 February 2022.
- 3. Upon redundancy, the telecommunications mast and equipment shall be permanently removed and the land reinstated to its former condition within a period of six months.
- 4. Prior to commencement of the development hereby approved, a Construction and Environmental Management Plan including details of environmental protection measures to be implemented throughout the construction phase, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Thereafter, the development shall be implemented in accordance with the approved Plan.
- 5. The lattice tower hereby approved shall be painted RAL 6022 Olive Drab in colour not later than 30 days after the substantial completion of the development.
- 6. Notwithstanding the submitted detail, prior to first use of the development hereby permitted, the compound shall be enclosed with a 2.4m high feather board fence, with 2.4m high timber gates and maintained as such in perpetuity.
- 7. Prior to the commencement of the development hereby permitted, details of the construction and surfacing of the proposed stone track, turning area, and tower foundation, shall be submitted to the

Local Planning Authority for written approval.

- 8. The generator as included with the proposal shall be for emergency back up use only in the event of a short term loss of mains power to the site.
- 9. No external lighting shall be installed or used in association with the development hereby approved.

#### 1 Introduction

- 1.1 The application proposes to erect a 30m high lattice telecommunications tower with ancillary equipment on land at Blackingstone Wood, housed within a 10m x 7.5m compound. The tower will be located on open ground in the middle of the wood. Access will be via an existing forestry road.
- 1.2 The telecommunications mast is proposed in support of the Shared Rural Network (SRN) initiative. The Shared Rural Network (SRN) is a collaboration between Mobile Network Operators (MNOs) and Government to improve 4G coverage for people living, working and travelling in poorly served rural areas.
- 1.3 The application is presented to the committee in view of its potential impact and policy implications.

#### 2 Relevant Local Plan Policies

- SP1.1 Delivering National Park purposes and protecting Dartmoor's Special Qualities
- SP1.2 Sustainable development in Dartmoor National Park
- SP2.1 Protecting the character of Dartmoor's landscape
- SP2.2 Conserving and enhancing Dartmoor's biodiversity and geodiversity
- SP2.3 Biodiversity Net Gain
- SP2.4 Conserving and enhancing Dartmoor's moorland, heathland and woodland
- SP2.7 Conserving and enhancing heritage assets
- SP4.7 Telecommunications Development

#### 3 Planning History

3.1 None.

#### 4 Consultations

- 4.1 Environment Agency Flood Risk Zone 1 Standing advice
- 4.2 Teignbridge District Council Did not wish to comment
- 4.3 County EEC Directorate No objection
- 4.4 DNP Trees & Landscape No objection

- 4.4.1 The woodland is a large productive mature conifer plantation. Extensive felling and replanting is carried out throughout the wood. The surrounding land is grazed farmland.
- 4.4.2 Policy is very clear that development should conserve and/or enhance the character of Dartmoor's landscape. The tower and infrastructure will have an impact on the character of the area. However, legislation is changing and it will be possible to erect towers of up to 25m without the need for planning consent and, in landscape terms, erecting a 35m tower in a conifer wood is preferable to erecting multiple towers across an open landscape.
- 4.4.3 Visual amenity: The tower will be located close in the middle of the plantation. The tower will mostly be hidden from view, the upper parts may be visible from Blackingstone Rock, Heltor Rock and from other distant locations. The compound and other infrastructure will be hidden from view. The tower will be viewed in association with a conifer wood and will not be visually intrusive.
- 4.4.4 No mitigation is proposed.
- 4.5 DNP Ecology & Wildlife No objection
- 4.5.1 An ecological assessment (The Ecology Practice, 7/6/22 ref 19713-EcoA\_B) has been submitted. The survey methods, presentation of results and recommendations are mostly satisfactory.
- 4.5.2 The proposed site is dominated by relatively immature conifer plantation of low biodiversity value. No protected or notable species were identified as being affected by the construction or operation, but precautionary recommendations were made to mitigate potential construction impacts on badgers and breeding birds.

#### **Biodiversity net gain**

- 4.5.3 The report considers the proposed development against DNP local plan policy but fails to present any positive recommendation, other than to rule out the suggested biodiversity enhancements listed in the local plan policy. The meaning of section 5.4.6 is not clear but appears to confuse the lack of any need for biodiversity <u>compensation</u> with the need to demonstrate reasonable biodiversity <u>enhancement</u> (net gain) in line with local policy.
- 4.5.4 No objection on ecology grounds. The development should proceed in accordance with the recommendations and requirements stated in section 5 of the Ecological Assessment by The Ecology Practice, dated 7/6/22.
- 4.5.5 Further clarification is needed on the approach to biodiversity enhancement in line with local policy, but detail could potentially be finalised through planning condition after determination.
- 4.6 DNP Archaeology No objection

#### 5 Parish Council Comments - Bridford Parish Council

5.1 For the greater good of a better mobile signal and with the future of copper phone connections being in doubt, coverage in a sparsely populated area could prove vital. The Parish Council supports this application.

#### 6 **Representations**

- 6.1 13 objections / 2 support / 2 general comments
- 6.2 The Authority has received a number of objections relating to the proposal, including:
  - Adverse impact on the character and appearance of the area
  - Adverse visual impact when viewed from nearby Blackingstone Rock and the wider vicinity
  - The lack of future tree cover from the plantation
  - Lack of an Ecological Impact Assessment
  - Perceived limited benefit with coverage predominantly over commercial forest / moorland and open farmland
  - Concern that mast will not provide coverage in areas such as Lower Ashton and Christow / doesn't provide coverage for majority of local residents
- 6.3 Two members of the public supported the proposal due to the benefits of improved mobile signal.

#### 7 Observations

#### JUSTIFICATION

- 7.1 The Shared Rural Network (SRN) is a collaboration between Mobile Network Operators (MNOs) and Government to improve 4G coverage for people living, working and travelling in poorly served rural areas. The network will ensure geographic coverage from at least one operator to 95% of the UK by the end of 2025, broadening consumer choice for mobile services in rural areas.
- 7.2 Across the UK, there will be a significant increase in the areas where all four operators deliver coverage, from 66% in 2020 to 84% by the end of 2025. MNOs are collectively investing £532 million to extend their coverage by upgrading their existing networks, working together on shared infrastructure and building new sites. Government is investing a further £500 million to build new masts in areas with no 4G coverage from any operator. Cornerstone are delivering the Shared Rural Network on behalf of the MNOs.
- 7.3 The SRN initiative is intended to deliver a shared infrastructure, being planning policy compliant, to provide an improved service while minimising environmental impact via reduced proliferation and minimised site numbers.
- 7.4 The SRN will deliver reliable 4G mobile connectivity to serve rural business, rural communities, and visitors to the National Park alike.
- 7.5 Coverage maps show significant improvements above that achieved by existing infrastructure, including improved external and internal reception in the area west of the Teign Valley.

PRINCIPLE OF THE PROPOSAL

- 7.6 Paragraph 176 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) is explicit that 'Great weight should be given to conserving and enhancing landscape and scenic beauty in National Parks...which have the highest status of protection in relation to these issues. The conservation and enhancement of wildlife and cultural heritage are also important considerations in these areas, and should be given great weight in National Parks...'
- 7.7 Paragraph 118 states that 'Local planning authorities must determine applications on planning grounds only. They should not seek to prevent competition between different operators, question the need for an electronic communications system, or set health safeguards different from the International Commission guidelines for public exposure'.

- 7.8 The English National Parks and Broads UK Government Vision Circular 2010 identifies that the Government continues to regard National Park designation as conferring the highest status of protection as far as landscape and natural beauty is concerned. The Parks represent an important contribution to the cultural and natural heritage of the nation. The Parks are living and working landscapes and over the centuries their natural beauty has been influenced by human activity such as farming and land management activities. The Circular also sets a renewed vision for achieving park purposes and established the importance of applying the Sandford Principle.
- 7.9 Dartmoor Local Plan Strategic Policy 1.1 sets out that development will be permitted that furthers, and does not prejudice, the statutory National Park purposes. Strategic Policy 2.1 states all development should conserve and enhance the character of the Dartmoor landscape by:
  - a) respecting the Valued Attributes of the Landscape Character Types identified in the Dartmoor National Park Landscape Character Assessment;
  - b) ensuring its location, layout, scale and design conserves and/ or enhances what is special or distinctive about landscape character;
  - c) retaining, integrating or enhancing distinctive local natural, semi-natural or cultural features;
  - d) avoiding unsympathetic development that will harm the landscape;
  - e) respecting the tranquillity and sense of remoteness of Dartmoor and not introducing or increasing light pollution; and
  - f) seeking opportunities to enhance landscape character.
- 7.10 Policy 4.7 is clear that new telecommunications infrastructure will only be permitted where:
  - a) evidence demonstrates the service cannot be delivered less harmfully by installing equipment on existing masts, buildings or other structures;
  - b) the equipment is located and designed to minimise its impact; and
  - c) the equipment does not cause substantial harm to the character and appearance of the built environment and/or the National Park's Special Qualities, particularly landscape character, heritage significance and tranquillity.

SITE CHARACTERISTICS

7.11 The woodland is a large productive mature conifer plantation. Extensive felling and replanting is carried out throughout the wood. The surrounding land is grazed farmland.

Landscape Character Type - 1J Farmed and Forested Plateau

- 7.12 The proposed development is located in a conifer woodland. The land around the site is undulating agricultural land comprising of small to medium sized fields enclosed by Devon hedge banks. This is a rolling pastoral landscape. Winding lanes bounded by hedges thread across the landscape. The land has a strong wooded character with a mosaic of conifer, mixed and broadleaved woodland. There is a sparse settlement pattern with small hamlets, villages and nucleated farmsteads nestled into the folded rolling landform and often surrounded by woodland. A tower of a similar size and construction is located on farmland immediately to the south of the application site.
- 7.13 The Landscape character Assessment lists valued attributes for this landscape type as:
  - Wooded character and variety mosaic of plantation, mixed, broadleaved and wet woodland providing a sense of enclosure.
  - Rolling pastoral farmland with some heathy patches and wetland habitats, crossed by an intricate network of narrow lanes.

- Strong regular field patterns with low-cut hedgerows and few hedgerow trees, giving parts of the plateau an open character.
- Its use as a water source for nearby populations, with 19th century reservoir structures contributing to character.
- Traditional orchards.
- Lightly settled character with a strong local vernacular.
- Managed recreational opportunities as an alternative to the open moor.
- Framed long-distance views from the undulating plateau to the high moorland to the west tors forming silhouettes on distant skylines.
- 7.14 The Authority's Trees and Landscape Officer has highlighted that policy is very clear that development should conserve and/or enhance the character of Dartmoor's landscape. The tower and infrastructure are considered to have an impact on the character of the area. Erecting a 35m tower in a conifer wood is preferable to erecting multiple towers across an open landscape.

#### VISUAL AMENITY

7.15 The tower will be located close in the middle of the plantation. The tower will mostly be hidden from view, the upper parts may be visible from Blackingstone Rock, Heltor Rock and from other distant locations. The compound and other infrastructure will be hidden from view. The tower will be viewed in association with a conifer wood and will not be visually intrusive.

#### ECOLOGY

- 7.16 The proposed lies within an immature conifer plantation of low biodiversity value. No protected or notable species are likely to be affected by the construction or operation, however it will be important to mitigate potential construction impacts on badgers and breeding birds.
- 7.17 Further clarification on the approach to biodiversity enhancement in line with local policy, will be needed. This will be finalised by planning condition.

#### ARCHAEOLOGY

7.18 No archaeological concerns were raised at this site.

#### OTHER MATTERS

- 7.19 The applicant has provided evidence that they have explored the options of erecting apparatus at alternative sites that were found to be non-viable. The opportunity to share the existing mast site to the south west of this location has also been explored. The anticipated improvements to coverage could not be gained from that site without significant adaption and increased height.
- 7.20 The applicant has provided comprehensive supporting documentation that includes consideration of mast solutions at a reduced scale. The operator has stated that they have 'carefully considered the design of the proposed mast. The structure has to be able to support the equipment for 3 operators. A lattice tower is the most suitable design from a technical viewpoint, given the wind loading in this exposed location. Such a design is also able to facilitate greater coverage (as they give better scope for antenna orientation) and provide the structural capability required to be able to support the weight and size of all the operators' telecommunications equipment. Due to the slim line nature of the supporting struts of the lattice frame, light is able to continue to pass through the structure. If the lattice tower were to be any slimmer in width, then it would not be structurally capable of supporting all the operators' equipment or meet the wind loading requirements'.

- 7.21 The SRN initiative is intended to deliver a shared infrastructure, being planning policy compliant, to provide an improved service while minimising environmental impact via reduced proliferation and minimised site numbers.
- 7.22 The Authority does not question the significant public benefit of the SRN as a nationwide initiative to provide enhanced 4G coverage. The Authority also welcomes the maximisation of each individual site through sharing the tower between multiple operators, with consequent limitation of adverse impact across the National Park.
- 7.23 The Authority recognises local frustration with a lack of coverage in nearby settlements. The mast is not however presented to provide enhanced coverage to the settlements of Christow and Lower Ashton where objectors have raised concern.
- 7.24 In response to DNPA queries, the applicant has stated "The site we are proposing at Blackingstone Wood is for the Shared Rural Network, providing geographical coverage to a Partial Not-Spot area of Dartmoor. The aim of the SRN project is to provide coverage over a large area, for several operators, to areas which currently suffer from partial coverage issues. This is different to Emergency Service Network (ESN), which deals with Total Not-Spot areas. The SRN sites will allow 3 operators (Vodafone, Telefonica and Three) to provide coverage to a large swathe of the area, as demonstrated by the coverage plots submitted as part of the application." "An alternative site at Bennah is located approximately 4.5km from the proposed site location at Blackingstone Wood. It was for a 15 metre high structure for Telefonica only. We have had confirmation that this site is no longer being progressed and has been dropped from scope at this time".
- 7.25 The applicant has provided comprehensive coverage maps that provide an idea of existing and proposed coverage across the local area. This mast is proposed to provide enhanced 4G coverage to areas with insufficient coverage at present as part of a national upgrade of 4G provision.
- 7.26 The significant public benefit of the proposal is clearly supported at both the National and Local level. The impact of the proposal is not considered significant by the Authority's Trees and Landscapes Officer. Following receipt of an Ecological Impact Assessment, the Authority's Ecologist has no objection, subject to conditions.

#### 8 CONCLUSION

8.1 For those reasons detailed above, the proposal is considered to meet the policy tests set out in SP1.1, SP1.2, and P4.7. The limited impact of the proposed mast in this location is offset by the wider public benefits of the system. The application is therefore recommended for approval, subject to appropriate conditions.



#### 

# Item **2**

Application No: Council	0073/22	District/Borough: West Devon Borough	
Application Type:	Full Planning Permission Parish: Dartmoor Forest		
Grid ref:	SX66397395	Officer: Christopher Hart	
Proposal:	Installation of 35m lattice tower supporting 6 no. antennas, 4 no. transmission dishes, 2 no. equipment cabinets, 1 no. meter cabinet and ancillary development including generator and associated fuel tank, a hard standing area, fenced compound and gabion wall.		
Location:	Land at Snider Park Plantation, Dartmeet		
Applicant:	Cornerstone, c/o agent Clarke Telecom Limited		
Recommendation:	That, subject to the consideration of any further comments from the Dartmoor Forest PC, permission be GRANTED		

# Conditions:

- 1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.
- 2. The development hereby approved, shall be carried out strictly in accordance with the approved Site Location Plan (100C), and drawings Detailed Site Access Map (101C), Proposed Site Plan (201E), and Proposed Site Elevation (301D), valid 7 July 2022.
- 3. No work shall commence on the development hereby permitted until a written scheme providing for an appropriately qualified archaeologist to carry out a full archaeological watching brief during all stages of the development has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The watching brief shall include all associated ground works, both internal and external, the laying of services and landscaping. The scheme, which shall be written and implemented at the applicant's expense, shall provide for the observation, recording and recovery of artefacts and post-excavation analysis. A full report detailing the findings shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority before the substantial completion of the development.
- 4. Prior to commencement of the development hereby approved, a Construction and Environmental Management Plan including details of environmental protection measures to be implemented throughout the construction phase, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Thereafter, the development shall be implemented in accordance with the approved Plan.

- 5. The lattice tower hereby approved shall be painted RAL 6022 Olive Drab in colour not later than 30 days after the substantial completion of the development.
- 6. Upon redundancy, the telecommunications mast and equipment shall be permanently removed and the land reinstated to its former condition within a period of six months.
- Notwithstanding the submitted detail, prior to first use of the development hereby permitted, the compound shall be enclosed with a 2.4m high feather board fence, with 2.4m high timber gates, constructed from natural timber and maintained as such in perpetuity.
- 8. Prior to the commencement of the development hereby permitted, details of the construction and surfacing of the proposed stone track, turning area, and tower foundation, shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for written approval.
- 9. The generator as included with the proposal shall be for emergency back up use only in the event of a short term loss of mains power to the site.
- 10. No external lighting shall be installed or used in association with the development hereby approved.

# 1 Introduction

- 1.1 The application is to erect a 35m high lattice telecommunications tower with ancillary equipment on land at Snider Forest Plantation. The tower will be located on open ground in the middle of the wood. The site for the tower has been cleared of trees. Access will be via an existing forestry road.
- 1.2 The telecommunications mast is proposed in support of the Shared Rural Network (SRN) initiative. The Shared Rural Network (SRN) is a collaboration between Mobile Network Operators (MNOs) and Government to improve 4G coverage for people living, working and travelling in poorly served rural areas.
- 1.3 The application is presented to the committee in view of its impact and policy implications.

## 2 Relevant Local Plan Policies

- SP1.1 Delivering National Park purposes and protecting Dartmoor's Special Qualities
- SP1.2 Sustainable development in Dartmoor National Park
- SP2.1 Protecting the character of Dartmoor's landscape
- SP2.2 Conserving and enhancing Dartmoor's biodiversity and geodiversity
- SP2.3 Biodiversity Net Gain
- SP2.4 Conserving and enhancing Dartmoor's moorland, heathland and woodland

- SP2.7 Conserving and enhancing heritage assets
- SP4.7 Telecommunications Development

# 3 Planning History

3.1 None.

# 4 Consultations

- 4.1 Environment Agency Flood Risk Zone 1 Standing advice
- 4.2 Teignbridge District Council Did not wish to comment.
- 4.3 County EEC Directorate No objection.
- 4.4 DNP Trees & Landscape Officer
- 4.4.1 The application is to erect a 35m high lattice telecommunications tower with ancillary equipment on land at Snider Forest Plantation. The tower will be located on open ground in the middle of the wood. The site for the tower has been cleared of trees. Access will be via an existing forestry road.
- 4.4.2 The woodland is a large productive mature conifer plantation. Extensive felling and replanting is carried out throughout the wood.
- 4.4.3 The site is surrounded by trees with lines of mature broadleaved trees growing along the southern and western boundaries.
- 4.4.4 The surrounding land is moorland with free public access.
- 4.4.5 Towers of the type proposed are not found in this immediate landscape The proposed development will have an impact on the character of the local landscape.
- 4.4.6 Policy is clear that development should conserve and/or enhance the character of Dartmoor's landscape. The tower and infrastructure will have an impact on the character of the area. However, legislation is changing and it will be possible to erect towers of up to 25m without the need for planning consent and, in landscape terms, erecting a 35m tower in a conifer wood is preferable to erecting multiple towers across an open landscape.
- 4.4.7 Visual amenity: The tower will be located close in the middle of the plantation and the upper parts of the tower will be visible from the open moorland particularly from Yar Tor to the east. The compound and other infrastructure will be hidden from view. The open moorland is heavily used for recreation, with many people visiting the area to experience the spectacular views of the surrounding landscape.
- 4.4.8 Whilst the tower will be seen from the open moor only part of the tower will be visible and it will not be visually intrusive.

- 4.4.9 The proposed tower and equipment will have limited impact on the character of the area and limited visual impact.
- 4.5 DNP Ecology & Wildlife No objection.
- 4.5.1 An ecological assessment (The Ecology Practice, 4/7/22 ref 19715-EcoA\_A) has been submitted. The survey methods, presentation of results and recommendations are mostly satisfactory.
- 4.5.2 The proposed site is dominated by previously felled plantation woodland now dominated by grasses, herbs and scattered scrub (bramble, European gorse). No protected or notable species were identified as being affected by the construction or operation, but precautionary recommendations were made to mitigate potential construction impacts on badger, hedgehog, reptiles and breeding birds.

### Biodiversity net gain

- 4.5.3 The report considers the proposed development against DNP local plan policy but fails to present any positive recommendation, other than to rule out the suggested biodiversity enhancements listed in the local plan policy. The need to compensate for loss of habitat appears to be accepted in section 5.7.9. I recommend that the means to achieve this and biodiversity enhancement are agreed.
- 4.5.4 No objection on ecology grounds. The development should proceed in accordance with the recommendations and requirements stated in section 5 of the Ecological Assessment by The Ecology Practice, dated 4/7/22.
- 4.5.5 Further clarification is needed on the approach to biodiversity enhancement in line with local policy, but detail could potentially be finalised through planning condition after determination.
- 4.6 DNP Archaeology
- 4.6.1 The proposed development is located within the industrial landscape of Brimpts Mine, which operated from at least the late 18th C. It is also situated on the eastern edge of a Middle Bronze Age agricultural landscape marked by the reaves on Brimpts and Huccaby Newtakes which is likely part of the more extensive Dartmeet reave system. There is thus an elevated potential for the presence of buried heritage assets with no current surface expression.
- 4.6.2 A leat which supplied water to Brimpts Mine runs across the southern part of the proposed development site. This feature is an integral part of the mine's infrastructure and thus possesses a degree of historical value and thus significance sufficient for it to be considered an undesignated heritage asset. Damage to the leat would have a negative impact not only on its significance, but that of the Brimpts Mine. It is therefore recommended that damage to this feature is avoided, preferably by redesigning or moving the development layout to accommodate it. In addition, during construction, access by site traffic should be controlled and routed to avoid the leat.
- 4.6.3 Given the archaeological sensitivity of the proposed development site, an archaeological watching brief is recommended (standard condition X03) in accordance with Strategic Policy 2.7. It should be noted that the means of supplying power to the proposed

development is not discussed in this application. A similar condition is recommended for any ground disturbance associated with this work.

- 4.6.4 In addition, it is recommended that the proposed development be designed/moved in order to preserve the Brimpts Mine leat which runs across the southern edge of the site as it is currently laid out.
- 4.6.5 The revised plans address the above concerns.

# 5 Parish Council Comments - Dartmoor Forest Parish Council

- 5.1 Dartmoor Forest Parish Council support this application.
- 5.2 The Council are concerned to maintain the screening currently provided by the wellestablished conifer plantation and mature deciduous trees found on three sides of the site. Council therefore recommends appropriate forestry management to retain adequate screening should clear felling of the conifers take place and that a Devon hedge be planted on the Northern boundary of the site, to provide additional screening.
- 5.3 The PC has been consulted on the revised plans. Any additional comments that are received will be reported at the meeting.

## 6 Representations

- 6.1 1 objection / 6 support / 1 general comment
- 6.2 1 letter of objection has been received. Comments include:
  - Noise of associated generator
  - Concern about possible upgrade to 5G- serious impact on human, animals, wildlife
  - Smaller mast allowing 3G coverage would be sufficient
  - Visual impact
- 6.3 6 letters of support have bene received. Comments include:
  - Support for enhanced 4G coverage to avoid 'falling behind'
  - Enhanced coverage will benefit local residents and businesses
  - Vital for emergency contact
  - Small price to pay for a modern amenity
  - The Forest Inn relies on having reliable internet for the customers and the card payment systems
  - Currently I am unable to work from home due to the terrible broadband coverage and no mobile signal.
- 6.4 One member of the public raised a general comment suggesting that a smaller scale / reduced height option may be available at the 'Hexworthy Mast Site'. The comment highlighted the reduced screening and increased exposure of the site as proposed.

# 7 Observations

## JUSTIFICATION

- 7.1 The Shared Rural Network (SRN) is a collaboration between Mobile Network Operators (MNOs) and Government to improve 4G coverage for people living, working and travelling in poorly served rural areas. The network will ensure geographic coverage from at least one operator to 95% of the UK by the end of 2025, broadening consumer choice for mobile services in rural areas.
- 7.2 Across the UK, there will be a significant increase in the areas where all four operators deliver coverage, from 66% in 2020 to 84% by the end of 2025. MNOs are collectively investing £532 million to extend their coverage by upgrading their existing networks, working together on shared infrastructure and building new sites. Government is investing a further £500 million to build new masts in areas with no 4G coverage from any operator. Cornerstone are delivering the Shared Rural Network on behalf of the MNOs.
- 7.3 The SRN initiative is intended to deliver a shared infrastructure, being planning policy compliant, to provide an improved service while minimising environmental impact via reduced proliferation and minimised site numbers.
- 7.4 The SRN will deliver reliable 4G mobile connectivity to serve rural business, rural communities, and visitors to the National Park alike.

## PRINCIPLE

- 7.5 Paragraph 176 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) is explicit that 'Great weight should be given to conserving and enhancing landscape and scenic beauty in National Parks...which have the highest status of protection in relation to these issues. The conservation and enhancement of wildlife and cultural heritage are also important considerations in these areas, and should be given great weight in National Parks...'
- 7.6 Paragraph 118 states that 'Local planning authorities must determine applications on planning grounds only. They should not seek to prevent competition between different operators, question the need for an electronic communications system, or set health safeguards different from the International Commission guidelines for public exposure'.
- 7.7 The English National Parks and Broads UK Government Vision Circular 2010 identifies that the Government continues to regard National Park designation as conferring the highest status of protection as far as landscape and natural beauty is concerned. The Parks represent an important contribution to the cultural and natural heritage of the nation. The Parks are living and working landscapes and over the centuries their natural beauty has been influenced by human activity such as farming and land management activities. The Circular also sets a renewed vision for achieving park purposes and established the importance of applying the Sandford Principle.
- 7.8 Dartmoor Local Plan Strategic Policy 1.1 sets out that development will be permitted that furthers, and does not prejudice, the statutory National Park purposes. Strategic Policy

2.1 states all development should conserve and enhance the character of the Dartmoor landscape by:

- a) respecting the Valued Attributes of the Landscape Character Types identified in the Dartmoor National Park Landscape Character Assessment;
- b) ensuring its location, layout, scale and design conserves and/ or enhances what is special or distinctive about landscape character;
- c) retaining, integrating or enhancing distinctive local natural, semi-natural or cultural features;
- d) avoiding unsympathetic development that will harm the landscape;
- e) respecting the tranquillity and sense of remoteness of Dartmoor and not introducing or increasing light pollution; and
- f) seeking opportunities to enhance landscape character.
- 7.9 Policy 4.7 is clear that new telecommunications infrastructure will only be permitted where:
  - a) evidence demonstrates the service cannot be delivered less harmfully by installing equipment on existing masts, buildings or other structures;
  - b) the equipment is located and designed to minimise its impact; and
  - c) the equipment does not cause substantial harm to the character and appearance of the built environment and/or the National Park's Special Qualities, particularly landscape character, heritage significance and tranquillity.

# SITE CHARACTERISTICS

7.10 The woodland is a large productive mature conifer plantation. Extensive felling and replanting is carried out throughout the wood. The site is surrounded by trees with lines of mature broadleaved trees growing along the southern and western boundaries. The surrounding land is moorland with free public access.

Landscape Character Type – 1L Upland Moorland with Tors

- 7.11 The proposed tower is located in a conifer planation. This part of Dartmoor is a dramatic, rolling, large scale moorland landscape interspersed with large conifer plantations. These plantations create dark blocks with hard edges contrasting with the smoother open moorland. The open moorland is grazed with cattle, sheep and ponies. Distant granite tors are a feature of the landscape. Public rights of way run across the open moorland. This is a tranquil landscape with low levels of light pollution. There are no obvious vertical structures, similar to the proposed tower, in the immediate area.
- 7.12 The Landscape character Assessment lists valued attributes for this landscape type as:
  - Dramatic moorland landscape, with wide open spaces, panoramic views and a strong sense of tranquillity.
  - Traditional upland farming communities with the moorland grazed by Dartmoor ponies and native hill breeds of sheep and cattle.
  - Valued wildlife habitats including blanket bogs, mires and heather moorland home to rare upland birds.
  - Hill tops dominated by granite tors and other geological features.

- Rich archaeological heritage with numerous archaeological remains.
- Unifying granite local vernacular displayed in farmhouses, bridges, stone walls and settlements linked by deep lanes.
- Valued area for recreation, with large tracts of open access land.
- 7.13 Towers of the type proposed are not found in this immediate landscape and the proposed development will have an impact on the character of the local landscape.
- 7.14 Development should conserve and/or enhance the character of Dartmoor's landscape. The tower and infrastructure will have an impact on the character of the area. However erecting a 35m tower in a conifer wood is probably preferable to erecting multiple towers across an open landscape.

VISUAL AMENITY

- 7.15 The tower will be located close in the middle of the plantation and the upper parts of the tower will be visible from the open moorland particularly from Yar Tor to the east. The compound and other infrastructure will be hidden from view. The open moorland is heavily used for recreation, with many people visiting the area to experience the spectacular views of the surrounding landscape. Whilst the tower will be seen from the open moor only part of the tower will be visible and it will not be visually intrusive.
- 7.16 The proposed tower and equipment will have limited impact on the character of the area and limited visual impact. The Authority's Trees and Landscapes Officer raises no objection to the proposal.

ECOLOGY

7.17 There are no objections from an ecology point of view.

## ARCHAEOLOGY

- 7.18 The Authority's Archaeologist has identified an elevated potential for the presence of buried heritage assets with no current surface expression. An archaeological watching brief is included to investigate and conserve the archaeological heritage of this part of the National Park in accordance with policy SP2.7 of the Dartmoor Local Plan.
- 7.19 The Authority's Archaeologist also identified a historic leat that ran under the original site. The applicant was advised to move the site 9m to the north and provide a revised access to avoid adverse impact on the heritage present.
- 7.20 Following receipt of the revised plan, the Authority's Archaeologist raises no objection, subject to conditions.

OTHER MATTERS

7.21 The applicant has provided evidence that they have explored the options of erecting apparatus at alternative sites that were found to be non-viable.

- 7.22 The applicant has provided comprehensive supporting documentation that includes consideration of mast solutions at a reduced scale. The operator has stated that they have 'carefully considered the design of the proposed mast. The structure has to be able to support the equipment for 3 operators. A lattice tower is the most suitable design from a technical viewpoint, given the windloading in this exposed location. Such a design is also able to facilitate greater coverage (as they give better scope for antenna orientation) and provide the structural capability required to be able to support the weight and size of all the operators' telecommunications equipment. Due to the slim line nature of the supporting struts of the lattice frame, light is able to continue to pass through the structurally capable of supporting all the operators' equipment or meet the windloading requirements. The colour of the tower is proposed to be galvanised grey as this is considered to be the best colour to blend with the typically grey British skyline. However, it can be coloured any other colour that the authority considers appropriate.'
- 7.23 The Authority has requested that the lattice tower be painted RAL 6022 Olive Drab in colour.
- 7.24 The SRN initiative is intended to deliver a shared infrastructure, being planning policy compliant, to provide an improved service while minimising environmental impact via reduced proliferation and minimised site numbers.
- 7.25 The Authority does not question the significant public benefit of the SRN as a nationwide initiative to provide enhanced 4G coverage. The Authority also welcomes the maximisation of each individual site through sharing the tower between multiple operators, with consequent limitation of adverse impact across the National Park.
- 7.26 The applicant has provided comprehensive coverage maps that provide an idea of existing and proposed coverage across the local area. This mast is proposed to provide enhanced 4G coverage to areas with insufficient coverage at present as part of a national upgrade of 4G provision.
- 7.27 The significant public benefit of the proposal is clearly supported at both the National and Local level. The impact of the proposal is not considered significant by the Authority's Trees and Landscapes Officer.

# 8 Conclusion

- 8.1 The provision of a telecommunications mast in this location will undoubtedly provide significant public benefits to nearby residents in the Hexworthy/Dartmeet area and visitors to this area. This must be tempered against the visual impact of equipment which will be seen above the tree canopy in a location surrounded by open moorland. That impact is limited and outweighed by the perceived public benefits.
- 8.2 The proposal is considered to meet the policy tests set out in SP1.1, SP1.2, and P4.7, and the policy position established under the Dartmoor Local Plan. The application is therefore recommended for approval, subject to appropriate conditions.

# **Dartmoor National Park Authority**

0189/22 - Heatherside House, Dousland



Scale 1:1,500

Compiled by swilliams on 14/7/2022



Item 3

Application No:	0189/22	District/Borough: West Devon Borough	
Application Type:	Full Planning Permission	Parish:	Walkhampton
Grid Ref:	SX53456888	Officer:	Sassie Williams
Proposal:	Change of use from a residential care home to education use with associated external alterations		
Location:	Heatherside House, Princetown Road, Dousland, Yelverton		
Applicant:	Spaghetti Bridge		
Recommendation:	That permission be GRANTE	D	

Conditions:

- 1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.
- The development hereby approved shall be carried out strictly in accordance with the Site Location Plan and drawings 2289-MAL-XX-XX-DR-A-A004 P3, 2289-MAL-XX-XX-DR-A-A005 P3, 2289-MAL-XX-XX-DR-A-A007 P4 and 2289-MAL-XX-XX-DR-A-A009 P3 valid 24 May 2022.
- 3. No part of the development hereby approved shall be brought into its intended use until the access, parking facilities and turning area have been provided and maintained in accordance with the application drawings and retained for that purpose at all times.
- 4. The land edged red on the approved Location Plan shall only be used for educational purposes, operating Monday to Friday and during school academic terms only and for no other purpose.
- 5. The school shall be limited to a maximum student intake of 60 students at any one time. An up-to-date register of students shall be maintained and made available to the Local Planning Authority upon request.
- 6. Prior to the development hereby approved being brought into its intended use, the existing gated pedestrian right of way through the garden of Fieldside shall be permanently stopped up and thereafter shall not be used as a means of access to Heatherside House.
- 7. At no time shall any exterior lighting be installed within the paddock or along the perimeters of the site. Any external lighting installed in association with the main school building shall be used during school operating hours only.

# 1 Introduction

- 1.1 The site lies on the westernmost edge of Dousland, on the north side of Princetown Road (B3212), and around 1km north east of Yelverton. Heatherside and its surrounding grounds fall within the Dousland settlement boundary, while the paddock to the South of the building does not. The building is double fronted with large bay windows, dating back to the first half of the twentieth century. It has a single storey, pitched roof extension to the side, and a number of large flat- and pitched-roofed single storey extensions to the rear. The site is accessed via a track running north from the B3212, which also serves three dwellings.
- 1.2 Within the plot, the extended building covers a large footprint which extends to the northern (rear) and western boundaries. A tarmac area lies to the south (front) and side, while a large lawn and greenhouses lie to the east. To the south lies a paddock with three stables which runs alongside the access track.
- 1.3 To the north and west of the site lie open fields, and these boundaries are formed of hedgerows and mature trees. To the east of the site are plots of land associated with houses further to the east on Merrivale View Road, and this boundary is formed of a close-boarded timber fence roughly 2m high and mature trees. To the south, the site abounds the garden of the adjacent dwelling 'Sunnyside' with a garden hedge forming the boundary. The dwellings Sunnyside and Standarhay both front onto the access track and overlook the paddock.
- 1.4 The application is for full planning permission for change of use from a care home (planning use class C2) to a Special Educational Needs school (planning use class F1) with associated external alterations. It is a 31-bed care home most recently used to accommodate adults with learning difficulties and is understood to have been vacant since June 2021.
- 1.5 The application is brought before the committee in view of the strength of local opinion and policy implications.

# 2 Planning History

0539/15	Single storey extension to existing care home Grant Conditionally 14/12/2015
0598/08	Part demolition of existing single storey extension and construction of 17 one bedroom units of accommodation for the elderly Refused 11/11/2008
0254/01	Single-storey extension to provide a store Grant Conditionally 07/06/2001
0103/98	Single storey infill extension to provide new kitchen/laundry & bathroom, new front entrance porch and detached storage building Grant Unconditionally 02/02/1999
03/53/1052/8	Change of use of adjacent properties "Standar-hay" and "Sunnyside" to provide additional accommodation for existing residential home Grant Conditionally 03/04/1987

03/53/0154/85	Residential development Refused 20/03/1985	Appeal Dismissed 30/10/1985
03/53/1237/84	Erection of two greenhous occupational therapy for re Grant Conditionally	ses for the purpose of providing esidents 04/10/1984
03/53/0845/83	Single storey extension at Grant Conditionally	rear to provide staff living accommodation 01/07/1983
03/53/0400/83	Erection of three stables Grant Conditionally	06/05/1983
03/53/0101/82	Erection of a dwellinghous Refused	se and garage 05/11/1982
03/53/1210/81	Proposed erection of dwe Refused	ling-house with garage 04/12/1981
03/53/1368/78	Erection of six bungalows Refused	08/12/1978

# 3 Consultations

- 3.1 County EEC Directorate (Highways)
- 3.1.1 The application is supported by the provision of a Transport Statement (TS), written on behalf of the applicant by the applicants' consultant engineers, Vectos.
- 3.1.2 The highway authority is generally in agreement with its content, contained information and conclusions drawn. As detailed in the TS, the visibility available from the access is acceptable for the approach speeds on the B3212. The alignment of the carriageway in that direction provides a much greater visibility in that direction, commensurate with the higher approach speeds.
- 3.1.3 It was noted from a site inspection that the surface of the first few metres of the site access from the edge of the carriageway is poorly surfaced, but this section forms part of the highway maintained at the public' expense, so that is a matter for the highway authority to address in due course, commensurate with its other responsibilities.
- 3.1.4 As identified in the TS, the proposed change of use will result in a slightly higher number of vehicle movements, when compared to the existing authorised use of the site and the highway authority is satisfied that the access is entirely suitable for that purpose and no objection is raised on highway grounds to the proposals.
- 3.1.5 The following condition should be incorporated in any grant of permission.

1. No part of the development hereby approved shall be brought into its intended use until the access, parking facilities and turning area have been provided and maintained in accordance with the application drawings and retained for that purpose at all times

- 3.2 Environment Agency Flood zone 1 standing advice applies
- 3.3 Devon County Council (Education)

No comments received to date

- 3.4 Plymouth City Council
- 3.4.1 The request for change of use to an education centre is supported by Plymouth City Council (PCC). PCC has an urgent need for additional school places that offer specialist education for children with Education Health and Care plans.
- 3.4.2 This request is something that we have been in discussion about with the purchaser of the property.
- 3.5 Cornwall Council No comments received to date
- 3.6 Devon & Cornwall Police
- 3.6.1 It is understood from the plans that fencing will be installed around the recreational areas of varying height of 1.8m and 1.2m. It is recommended that the boundary treatment to the outer perimeter is of the height of 1.8m in height, providing a secure boundary for the safety and security of the children, keeping them within the boundaries of the school and keeping the uninvited out. 1.2m should really only be used as a demarcation to a boundary and controlling movement and not for security proposes.
- 3.6.2 Where gates are installed, these should be of the same height as the adjoining boundary treatment, it should not be possible to lift the gates from its hinges, the hinges and lock cylinder should be protected in such a way as to prevent them inadvertently being used as a climbing aid. Care should also be taken to ensure the construction of the gate does not act as a climbing aid or allow for someone to pass under the gate when closed.
- 3.6.3 Care should be taken where building or utility equipment are next to the boundary treatments which could be used as climbing aids in and out of the school. The location of the waste store as an example, does cause a concern given it appears to be next to the boundary fencing, depending on the construction of the store it could be used as a climbing aid over the boundary fence. It is therefore recommended the boundary fence is higher at this point to prevent this. It may also be beneficial to use defensible planting along the sides of the store to add a layer of protection to prevent someone climbing on top of the store.
- 3.6.4 It is appreciated this is a change of use application and will not take into account the internal layout however it would be recommended that the practices and principles of Secured by Design Schools Guide attached are adhered to where possible as this will ensure a consistent level of security throughout and minimise opportunity for crime, fear of crime and ASB. Further points of advice and recommendations for the applicant are provided relating to the internal layout and other matters which fall outside the scope of this planning application.

# 4 Parish/Town Council Comments - Burrator Parish Council

4.1 Parish Council has no objections to the development.

# 5 Relevant Development Plan Policies

## Dartmoor Local Plan 2018-2036

Strategic Policy 1.1 Delivering National Park purposes and protecting Dartmoor's Special Qualities.
Strategic Policy 1.2 Sustainable development in Dartmoor National Park.
Strategic Policy 1.3 Spatial Strategy.
Strategic Policy 1.5 Delivering good design.
Policy 1.7 Protecting local amenity in Dartmoor National Park.
Strategic Policy 2.6 Protecting tranquillity and dark night skies.
Policy 4.5 Electric Vehicle Charging Points (EVCPs).
Strategic Policy 4.1 Supporting community services and facilities
Policy 7.1 Settlement Boundaries and Development Sites

## 6 Representations

6.1

- 9 letters of objection
  1 petition objecting (21 signatures 9 of which are objectors above)
  1 other letter
- 6.2 Summary of comments in support none received.
- 6.3 Summary of comments of objection Objections express the following concerns:
  - safety of vehicular access junction on B3212
  - narrow access lane with few passing places
  - increase in traffic movements, especially at peak times
  - lack of adequate parking provided on the site
  - maintenance of access which is in poor condition
  - that boundary treatments are not sufficient to keep pupils safe
  - significant increase in noise and traffic at peak times
  - long travel distances in private cars for pupils and staff not sustainable
  - wide catchment does not fit with local focus of Dartmoor policies
  - noise of outdoor play at break times will disrupt tranquillity
  - lack of public transport links in Dousland
  - lack of pedestrian links
  - proposed secure boundary fencing is ugly and out of keeping with area
  - change of use of paddock and loss of biodiversity
- 6.4 Observations / general comments:
  - Difficult to interpret drawings submitted with transport statement;
  - request that the applicant delineate the public right of way across land owned by Fieldside with a small fence or hedge and to provide a gate at the Fieldside end of the path;
  - Seek assurances that detrimetal impact on neighbours of high intensity external lighting previously associated with care home request that this not be carried forward with this application

# 7 Observations

THE PROPOSAL

- 7.1 The application seeks planning permission for the change of use of Heatherside House from residential care home (planning use class C2) to education use (planning use class F1) with associated external alterations. The applicants propose to open a special educational needs (SEN) school for children and young adults aged 6-19 years on the site, following a similar model to the schools they already run in Taunton and Torbay.
- 7.2 The school would cater for up to 60 pupils, though on average (based on their other sites) it is expected to have 40-45 pupils on site at any one time, with a staffing ratio of 1:3 this would mean 15-20 staff on site. The pupils would have social, emotional and/or mental heath needs and/or Autistic Spectrum Disorder.
- 7.3 School hours would be from 09.30 until 14.30 Monday to Friday in term time only.
- 7.4 Evidence of the need for the school has been provided in the planning statement and is derived from the wider area of East Cornwall, Plymouth and West Devon. While the school is likely to serve some local / Dartmoor-based pupils, it is clear that the school would serve a much wider need originating outside the National Park.
- 7.5 In addition to the change of use, the following associated external alterations are proposed: the provision of 23 parking spaces (3 of which are disabled spaces); the installation of an electric vehicle charging point; the installation of 1.8m hit-and-miss timber fencing to the perimeter where necessary (north, south and west boundaries, fencing already present on east boundary), the installation of 1.2m hit-and-miss timber fencing to enclose recreational areas, and the installation of 6 new uPVC doors and one new uPVC window on the side and rear elevations to match existing doors and windows.

POLICY BACKGROUND AND MATERIAL PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

- 7.6 The Dartmoor Local Plan was adopted in December 2021. Its vision is focussed on protecting the special qualities of the National Park whilst meeting the needs of its communities. Strategic policies 1.1, 1.2 and the spatial strategy contained in Strategic Policy 1.3 set out the framework for meeting this vision. Development opportunities will be constrained to sustainable locations identified within the plan.
- 7.7 The Local Plan cannot cater for all development types; where applications are not neatly allied to a specific policy they need to be considered against the planning policies of the National Park as a whole and in particular Strategic Policies 1.1 and 1.2.
- 7.8 Strategic Policy 1.2 establishes the presumption in favour of sustainable development and a positive approach to working toward this, working with applicants to find solutions where applications can be approved wherever possible and to secure development that improves the economic, social and environmental conditions of the area. In particular, this policy requires development within the National Park to come forward in a sustainable manner, meaning amongst other

things that it (b) minimises our impact upon climate change by ensuring development takes place where it minimises the need to travel, conserves resources and reduces waste, (d) makes efficient use of land and infrastructure, in particular by prioritising the use of previously developed land and buildings, (e) promotes the health, safety and wellbeing of the population, including by improving and supporting access to workplaces and housing, and (m) supports the economic vitality of the National Park.

- 7.9 Strategic Policy 1.3 sets out the spatial strategy for development within the National Park. The site lies within the identified Settlement Boundary of Dousland, and therefore for the purposes of policy interpretation is considered to be within the Rural Settlement as defined in the Local Plan. Part 2 of the policy states that within Rural Settlements, development intended to meet the needs of the settlement and its parish will be acceptable in principle and lists the priorities for development in these locations as (amongst other things) (b) giving opportunities for new or improved small-scale employment sites where opportunities exist and (c) maintaining or enhancing a range of services and facilities which serve the settlement. The pre-amble describes Rural Settlements as "better placed to meet the development needs of the settlement and surrounding parish" (paragraph 1.4.6), however it is recognised that this is a priority and not an absolute requirement, and this does not prevent appropriate and policy-compliant developments from coming forward in these locations which serve a wider evidenced need.
- 7.10 Strategic Policy 4.1 supports community facilities and services, which are described as "social and cultural services and facilities which support the social wellbeing of the community as a whole, or a substantial portion of it" (paragraph 4.1.1) and include education facilities (paragraph 4.1.2). Part 3 of the policy states that within classified settlements, the provision of new community facilities will be supported. While in-principal support for new facilities in settlements is clear, it is recognised that in this instance the proposed education facility would serve not just the local community, but a much wider catchment, and evidence of need for the school has been provided on this basis. This raises questions of sustainability which are considered in the section below.
- 7.11 The material planning considerations in relation to this application are deemed to be as follows, and these will be considered in more detail in the following sections:
  - (i) Whether the proposal represents sustainable development
  - (iii) Impacts on highway safety
  - (iv) Impacts on neighbour amenity

SUSTAINABILITY AND COMMUNITY / WIDER BENEFITS

- 7.12 Achieving sustainable development is a key objective of the Dartmoor Local Plan, and in reality it is a complex task involving the balancing of a number of often competing priorities. Paragraph 1.3.2 of the Local Plan refers to the environment, society and economy as being the three pillars of sustainability, and this is important to keep in mind when assessing whether a planning application represents sustainable development.
- 7.13 The expected catchment area based on evidenced need comprises rural Devon and Cornwall, as well as the conurbations of Plymouth, Liskeard, Callington, Saltash,

Launceston, Okehampton, Tavistock and Ivybridge, the nearest of which being 15 minutes' drive and the furthest around 45 minutes' drive. The applicant states that based on data from their other sites, on average two thirds of pupils travel by taxi, with up to 3 pupils sharing one taxi, and the remaining third travel by private car. At the time of writing, direct consultation with Plymouth City Council has confirmed the need in this area, and responses from Devon and Cornwall Councils are still outstanding.

- 7.14 Policy 1.2 sets out how development proposals should pursue sustainable development within the National Park. In relation to the requirement of this policy, the proposal would:
  - provide an education facility for which there is a proven extant need in the area, thus reducing travelling distances for local pupils currently travelling outside of the area to attend a more distant specialist school due to a lack of more local provision (part 1b).
  - ensure an ongoing viable use for a large and currently vacant building and site, making efficient use of the Park's limited land and infrastructure (part 1d)
  - improve access to specialist education and employment, thereby promoting the health, safety and wellbeing of the population (parts 1e and 1f)
  - create new employment opportunities, supporting the economic vitality of the National Park (part 1m).
- 7.15 The proposed site is accessible with good road links, being accessed directly from the B3212 and located just 1km from Yelverton with its associated wider road links to Plymouth, Tavistock and West Cornwall via A- and B- roads.
- 7.16 Within Rural Settlements, policy 1.3 part 2 provides opportunities to provide new small-scale employment sites where appropriate opportunities exist (part 1b) and enhance a range of services and facilities which serve the settlement (part 1c) within Rural Settlements. The proposal would provide a new education facility which would serve both a local and wider need, along with associated employment opportunities, and is therefore considered to bring social and economic benefits to Dousland, nearby Yelverton and this part of the National Park.
- 7.17 It is also notable that pupils of the proposed special educational needs school would benefit from the tranquil semi-rural setting to support their learning and well-being.

HIGHWAY SAFETY AND PARKING

- 7.18 Access to the school would be via the existing junction on Princetown Road and the existing track serving Heatherside and three residential dwellings. The track runs alongside the length of the paddock and passes the front of Standarhay and Sunnyside. The agent confirms that for the most part the track is wide enough to facilitate two-way traffic. A number of objections have been received to the proposed access which are summarised in the representations section.
- 7.19 The application is accompanied by a Transport Statement which quantifies trip

generation estimates and provides related traffic impacts of the proposed development. The Highway Officer is generally in agreement with the content of the report and conclusions drawn.

- 7.20 The Highway Officer raises no objection to the scheme, on the basis that visibility at the junction with Princetown Road is acceptable and the access is suitable to accommodate the proposed change of use and slightly higher number of vehicle movements projected.
- 7.21 Additional traffic will be generated by the development, however it is important to consider this against the baseline of the existing lawful C2 use, which includes residential care homes, hospitals, nursing homes, boarding schools, residential colleges and training centres.
- 7.22 It is also relevant to note that the proposed change of use would lead to a change in traffic patterns when compared with the existing use as a residential care home, which operates 24 hours per day and 365 days per year. Traffic associated with the proposed use would mostly fall between the hours of 9-10am and 2-3pm, which is outside of peak traffic times, and would be limited to Monday-Friday and term times, meaning a significant reduction in traffic to the site during evenings, weekends and school holidays when compared with the previous use.
- 7.23 The modest increase in vehicle numbers predicted is considered to be proportionate to the nature of existing use and not unacceptable, particularly when taking into account the change in traffic patterns and significant reduction in traffic outside school hours.
- 7.24 The proposal includes the provision of 23 parking spaces, including 3 disabled spaces. Given that there will be an average of 15 and a maximum of 20 staff on site at any one time, this provision is considered sufficient to meet the needs of the school and avoid any detrimental impact on the surrounding area.
- 7.25 Currently there is a right of way linking Heatherside to Merrivale View to the east via land owned by Fieldside. The agent has confirmed that this is not proposed to be used and the existing gate is to be fixed shut, and this will be secured by condition to ensure residents of Merrivale View are not impacted by school-related pedestrian and vehicular traffic.

## AMENITY

- 7.26 Heatherside House is within the settlement boundary and surrounded by open fields to the north and west, garden plots (separated from their dwellings by a track) to the east, and the semi-detached dwellings known as Sunnyside and Standahay which adjoin the access track and paddock to the south-east. In terms of immediate neighbours, Sunnyside and Standarhay are the only dwellings immediately bordering the site.
- 7.27 It is important to consider the potential impacts of the proposal on neighbour amenity against the baseline existing C2 use, which was most recently a residential care home, but also includes a number of other lawful and potentially more intensive uses.

- 7.28 In terms of traffic, as already discussed there would be a modest overall increase in vehicle movements, although it is recognised that during peak school arrival and departure times there will be considerable numbers of cars using the access track which also serves the properties Sunnyside, Standarhay and Down Killick and this will have an impact on the residents of these properties. However given that peak site traffic would fall outside of normal peak school and work periods, and that there would be no vehicle movement associated with the site during evenings, weekends and school holidays, it is considered that the proposed change of use would have a neutral impact on the amenity of nearby residents (policy 1.7 part d).
- 7.29 As with any school use, it is anticipated that there will be some additional noise generated by children using the outdoor recreation areas during break periods and some lessons. This includes the occasional recreational use of paddock to the south of the main building for recreational purposes / physical education by small groups of supervised students. However again considering the baseline existing authorised use, which could include the use of the site as a boarding school and residential college, and total reduction in noise generated on the site during evenings, weekends and school holidays, again overall the proposed use is considered to have a neutral impact on neighbour amenity in terms of noise levels (policy 1.7 part c).
- 7.30 The proposal is not considered to impact on levels of privacy enjoyed by any neighbouring properties.
- 7.31 In terms of physical works, the erection of a hit-and-miss timber fence along the eastern boundary of the paddock, adjacent to the access track and directly opposite Sunnyside and Standarhay, will change the aspect and character that these immediate neighbours have enjoyed. However given that this is a residential area, the use of timber fencing as a means of enclosure would not appear out of place, and is therefore considered to pose a neutral impact on the character and appearance of the immediate vicinity in line with Strategic Policy 1.5.

## 8 Conclusion

- 8.1 The application seeks to provide a special education needs school to meet an evidenced need which spans the wider areas of West Devon and East Cornwall.
- 8.2 Locally, the proposal has the potential to bring benefits to the settlement, parish and this part of the National Park in terms of the provision of opportunities for employment and specialist education, and the tranquil semi-rural setting would support the learning and well-being of the school's prospective students.
- 8.3 The site is extensive and currently lies vacant, and this scheme presents a viable use which is different but not materially more intensive in terms of traffic movements and noise from the existing C2 use.
- 8.4 This is a site that can adequately accommodate the proposed development, within the defined boundary of a designated Rural Settlement in a well-connected part of the National Park. In that respect it falls within the wider definition of sustainable development. The application is therefore recommended for conditional approval.

# 0179/22 - Challacombe Farm, Postbridge

Scale 1:1,250



Item 4

Application No:	0179/22	District:	Teignbridge District Council	
Application Type:	Full Planning Permission Householder	Parish:	Manaton Parish Council	
Grid Ref:	SX693794	Officer:	Nicola White	
Proposal:	Installation of vertical slate rainscreen cladding to south elevation			
Location:	Challacombe Farm, Lane To Challacombe Farm, Widecombe-in-the-Moor			
Applicant:	Duchy of Cornwall			

Recommendation: That permission be GRANTED

Conditions:

- 1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.
- 2. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out strictly in accordance with the following approved drawings: the site location plan and block plan, valid 18 May 2022, and Drawing Number DMR-CHA-02 Rev1, valid 07 July 2022.
- 3. The slate hanging hereby approved shall be of Riverstone Ultra 500 x 250 natural slate. At all times thereafter the slate hanging shall be maintained in the approved natural slate.
- 4. The slate hanging hereby approved shall be fixed by nailing only, unless otherwise previously agreed by the Local Planning Authority in writing.
- 5. The extended area of roof slating shall be covered in a natural slate to match the existing roof slates.

# 1 Introduction

- 1.1 Challacombe Farm lies approximately 3km west of Widecombe-in-the-Moor. The farmhouse is located on the west side of the minor road linking Widecombe-in-the-Moor to the B3212.
- 1.2 It is proposed to slate hang the south gable of the property for weather proofing with a minor change to the existing roof.
- 1.3 The application is presented to Development Management Committee as the tenant of the property is a Member of the Authority.

# 2 Planning History

Construction of a timber storage shed to replace an existing shed			
5	Grant Conditionally	29 March 2010	
Tiodooffoldol			
Proposed conversion of existing barn to holiday accommodation			
Change of Use	Grant Conditionally	06 March 1981	
Proposed conversion of barns to holiday accommodation			
Change of Use	Grant Conditionally	01 August 1980	
	Full Planning Permission - Householder Proposed conversion of ex Change of Use Proposed conversion of ba	Full Planning Permission - Grant ConditionallyHouseholderProposed conversion of existing barn to holiday aChange of UseGrant ConditionallyProposed conversion of barns to holiday accomm	

# 3 Consultations

- 3.1 Environment Agency: Flood Zone 1 Standing Advice applied
- 3.2 County EEC Directorate No highway implications
- 3.3 Teignbridge District Council No objection

# 4 Parish/Town Council Comments – Manaton Parish Council

4.1 No comment received.

## 5 Relevant Development Plan Policies

Strategic Policy 1.1 Delivering National Park purposes and protecting Dartmoor's Special Qualities. Strategic Policy 1.2 Sustainable development in Dartmoor National Park. Strategic Policy 1.3 Spatial Strategy. Strategic Policy 1.5 Delivering good design. Strategic Policy 1.6 Sustainable construction. Policy 1.7 Protecting local amenity in Dartmoor National Park. Strategic Policy 2.1 Protecting the character of Dartmoor's landscape.

## 6 Representations

6.1 None to date.

## 7 Observations

SITE

7.1 The building is a nineteenth century farmhouse which forms part of an historic farmstead recorded on the Historic Environment Record. It is set away from the road, on the west side of the West Webburn River.

PROPOSAL

7.2 This application is to introduce slate hanging to the south gable-end, which is furthest from the driveway into the farm. A slight overhang with the verge slates is also required to accommodate the new slates. This seeks to provide weather proofing for the elevation facing into the prevailing weather in this exposed moorland location.

# ASSESSMENT

- 7.3 Slate hanging is the traditional way of adding weather protection to exposed parts of buildings.
- 7.4 The details submitted with this application are acceptable, using Riverstone Ultra natural slates and lead flashings. The proposed small extension to the roof slating will allow for an oversail of the proposed slate hanging.
- 7.5 The details respect the traditional character of the farmhouse, using an approach which is common in exposed areas of Dartmoor. The impact on the non-designated heritage asset is neutral and in all other respects this accords with Local Plan policy and good design principles.

# 0182/22 - Ingsdon View, Liverton

Scale 1:500



# Item 5

Application No:	0182/22	District:	Teignbri	idge District Council
Application Type:	Full Planning Permission - Householder	Parish:	llsington	
Grid Ref:	SX804751	Of	ficer:	Nicola White
Proposal:	Replacement extension and outbuildings			
Location:	Ingsdon View, Liverton			
Applicant:	Mr A Gandy & Miss W Couch			
Recommendation:	That permission be GRANTED			

Conditions:

- 1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.
- 2. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out strictly in accordance with the approved Site Location Plan, and drawings numbered PPL342/5, PL342/6, PL342/8, valid 06 May 2022.
- 3. Within twelve months of the date of this decision notice, the biodiversity enhancement measures described in the Design and Access Statement, received 06 May 2022 shall be completed, such that they comply with Part 3 of Policy 2.3 of the Dartmoor Local Plan (Biodiversity Net Gain). Thereafter, the approved biodiversity enhancement measures shall be maintained in perpetuity.
- 4. No external lighting shall be installed or used in association with the development hereby approved.
- 5. No demolition or building works shall take place during the bird nesting season (01 March to 31 August) unless a suitably qualified ecologist has confirmed in writing to the Local Planning Authority that the works will not disturb nesting birds.
- 6. Notwithstanding the drawings hereby approved, prior to their installation, details or samples of the roofing materials to be used in the approved development and their means of fixing shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for approval; thereafter, only the approved roofing materials shall be used in the development.
- 7. All new stonework shall be laid and pointed using traditional techniques and materials so as to match the stonework on the existing outbuilding. A sample panel shall be prepared for inspection by the Local Planning Authority and no further stonework shall be carried out until the sample panel has been inspected, and approved by, the Local Planning Authority.
- 8. Notwithstanding the drawings hereby approved, all external windows and doors in the development hereby permitted shall be of timber or aluminium construction and shall at all times thereafter be retained as timber or aluminium framed windows and doors.
- 9. The rooflights on the development hereby approved shall, unless otherwise agreed by the Local Planning Authority in writing, be flush fitting with their framing installed flush with the outer face of the roof slope.
- 10. The roof of the development hereby approved shall be covered in natural slate, sample(s) of which shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for approval prior to the commencement of any roofing work. At all times thereafter the roof shall be maintained in the approved natural slate.
- 11. The roof of the rear structure hereby approved shall be covered in natural slate which shall be fixed by nailing only.
- 12. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (England) Order 1995 or any Order revoking and re-enacting that Order with or without modification, other than those expressly authorised by this permission, no extension to the existing dwelling or to the building hereby permitted shall be constructed, and no windows or rooflights shall be installed, without the prior written authorisation of the Local Planning Authority.
- 13. Prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, samples of all proposed external facing materials shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for approval; thereafter unless otherwise agreed by the Local Planning Authority in writing only approved external facing shall be used in the development.
- 14. The roof of the development hereby approved shall be covered in natural slate, sample(s) of which shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for approval prior to the commencement of any roofing work. At all times thereafter the roof shall be maintained in the approved natural slate.

## 1 Introduction

- 1.1 Ingsdon View is an end-terrace property sitting on a corner plot in the historic centre of Old Liverton, a Rural Settlement within Dartmoor National Park. Whilst not a designated conservation area, Old Liverton's centre is sensitive and characteristic of Dartmoor's quaint rural villages.
- 1.2 This proposal is for the removal of the lean to and connected outbuildings and replacement with a dual pitched kitchen/diner and linking two outbuildings. The driveway would be reconfigured to make it useable.
- 1.3 This application is presented to committee as the Applicant is a member of staff.

## 2 Planning History

0618/18 Replacement single storey extension Full Planning Permission Grant Conditionally 20 December 2018 Householder

#### 3 Consultations

3.1 Environment Agency - Flood Zone 1 - Standing Advice.

- 3.2 County EEC Directorate No highway implications.
- 3.3 Teignbridge District Council No objection.

## 4 Parish/Town Council Comments – Ilsington Parish Council

4.1 No objection

## 5 Relevant Development Plan Policies

Strategic Policy 1.1 Delivering National Park purposes and protecting Dartmoor's Special Qualities Strategic Policy 1.2 Sustainable development in Dartmoor National Park Strategic Policy 1.3 Spatial Strategy Strategic Policy 1.5 Delivering good design Strategic Policy 1.6 Sustainable construction Policy 1.7 Protecting local amenity in Dartmoor National Park Strategic Policy 2.1 Protecting the character of Dartmoor's landscape Strategic Policy 2.2 Conserving and enhancing Dartmoor's biodiversity and geodiversity Strategic Policy 2.3 Biodiversity Net Gain Strategic Policy 2.6 Protecting tranquillity and dark night skies Policy 3.7 Residential alterations, extensions and outbuildings

## 6 Representations

6.1 None to date.

## 7 Observations

THE SITE

- 7.1 Ingsdon View is situated in Old Liverton.
- 7.2 It is a terraced traditional two up, two down cottage. It is of two-storeys with a single-storey lean to the rear of the terrace. The garage and outbuilding sit alongside this and into the garden. For the purposes of this report, the south west side of the property will be referred to as the rear.
- 7.3 The main garden lies to the front and side of the property with a garden gate giving access onto the lane. The property is well screened to the east by a substantial stone boundary wall and Devon bank facing onto the lane. The north west boundary is with the gardens on the rest of the terrace of cottages, and a drop in ground level to the south west to rear gardens.

#### THE PROPOSAL

7.4 The proposal under consideration is for the single storey extension to the rear, and outbuildings to the rear and front of the dwelling to achieve a more functional and useable ground floor space to accommodate the applicant's needs. This will be achieved by construction of a dual pitched kitchen/diner which will link to two modest outbuildings, replacing the existing dilapidated garage. The new courtyard layout will be arranged around an excavated driveway and turning area, that will make the driveway usable.

- 7.5 The extension to the rear is a simple structure that sits in neatly between the rear wall of the house and the boundary of property.
- 7.6 The proposal will use a variety of natural materials that reference Dartmoor's vernacular, including corrugated metal, cedar shingles, slate roof and dry stone walling. Vertical tongue and groove shadow gap cladding and a projecting bay window to the window provides a modern accent. Proportions of the replacement buildings are intentionally modest and fit with their historic surroundings.
- 7.7 A solar PV array is proposed to the south west outbuilding roof slope, not visible from the street.
- 7.8 In 2018 planning permission was granted for an extension similar to what is now proposed. These proposals are considered to represent a significant improvement on those already granted.

POLICY

- 7.9 Policy 3.7 refers to residential alterations and extensions and permits such development where it reflects the design principles set out in the design guide, is subservient to the original dwelling, conserves or enhances its character and does not increase habitable floor space by more than 30%.
- 7.10 Strategic Policies 2.2 and 2.3 refer to the conservation and enhancement of Dartmoor's biodiversity and biodiversity net gain respectively.

BIODIVERSITY

7.11 The Ecologist has no concerns regarding the proposal. As the proposal results in an increase in overall floor area, enhancement features are required under the provisions of Strategic Policy 2.7, and these (bird boxes, water butts and 15 m of dry stone walling) have been proposed.

ASSESSMENT

- 7.12 Ingsdon View is a modest terraced cottage with an ad hoc selection of extensions and outbuildings to the front and rear. The proposal is for their replacement with a cohesive extension and set of outbuildings. Cumulatively these remain modest and visually subservient to the dwelling and are considered to fall within the criteria set by Policy P3.7. The increase in habitable floor space is 24%
- 7.13 The topography and constrained nature of the site significantly limits opportunities for extensions to the rear of the buildings, an approach generally more favoured and encouraged in the Dartmoor Design Guide.
- 7.14 The proposal is not considered to harm the character of the wider area. The proposed extensions follow the existing domestic scale of the original cottage and provides for more functional accommodation. The proposal is relatively discrete and unobtrusive being set back from the lane and very well screened by the substantial stone boundary wall.
- 7.15 The property has immediate neighbours and no objections have been received. The proposed western elevation of the development takes a similar line to that already on site.

7.16 Any comments from the Parish Council will be reported at the meeting.

CONCLUSION

- 7.17 The proposal provides for the upgrading of the existing accommodation to make it more suitable for the needs of modern life, including the removal of an unattractive and poorly constructed range of extensions.
- 7.18 The proposal is undertaken in a sympathetic form and materials and as such reflects the expectations contained within Local Plan polices. It is recommended for approval subject to conditions regarding appropriate materials and detailing, and to secure biodiversity enhancement.

# **Dartmoor National Park Authority**

0205/22 - The Stores, South Zeal

ANTMOON ANTONAL YE

Scale 1:578



Item 6

Application No:	0205/22	District/Borough:	West Devon Borough
Application Type:	Full Planning Permission	Parish:	South Tawton
Grid Ref:	SX651935	Officer:	Oliver Dorrell
Proposal:	Change of use of shop, cafe and post office counter to residential accommodation as part of the existing dwelling		
Location:	The Stores, South Zeal		
Applicant:	Mr & Mrs Hill		
Recommendation:	That, subject to the consideration of any comments from the South Tawton PC, permission be REFUSED		

#### Reason(s) for Refusal

- 1. The proposed development would result in the loss of the last general store and post office within the classified settlement of South Zeal which is identified as an important community service. It has not been demonstrated that the business has been offered for a realistic price for a period in excess of 12 months and there is evidence to indicate that the business is not currently being operated at its full potential. The proposed development would be contrary to the Dartmoor Local Plan, in particular policies SP1.1, SP1.2, SP4.1, SP5.1 and SP5.3, and to the advice contained in the English National Parks and the Broads UK Government Vision and Circular 2010 and the National Planning Policy Framework 2021.
- 2. The proposed development would cause less than substantial harm to the significance of the building and the character of the South Zeal conservation area which, in the absence of any identified public benefit to outweigh the harm identified, would be contrary to policies SP1.1 and SP2.7 of the Dartmoor Local Plan, the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 as amended, the advice contained in the English National Parks and the Broads UK Government Vision and Circular 2010 and the National Planning Policy Framework 2021.

## 1 Introduction

- 1.1 This application concerns the building known as 'The Stores' in South Zeal. The building is two storey comprising a shop, post office and café on the ground floor and residential accommodation above. It is grade II listed.
- 1.2 The site is located on the corner of the main village road and Tawton Lane in the centre of the village and the South Zeal conservation area. The chapel of St Mary's (grade II) is to the east and the Oxenham Arms pub (grade II\*) is opposite.
- 1.3 This application is brought to Development Management Committee for determination due to the level of public interest and policy implications.

## 2 Planning History

0001/03	Demolish old shed attached to kitchen wall and re-build kitchen, attach lean-to storeroom to kitchen and lean-to passage to connect two, first floor extension above existing kitchen		
0002/03	Full Planning Permission Demolish old shed attached to attach lean-to storeroom to kito floor extension above existing l	Grant Conditionally existing kitchen wall ar then and lean-to passa	nd re-build kitchen,
	•	Grant Conditionally	11 February 2003
0831/02	Alterations to front access to sh steps down to area adjacent to	nop to create disabled i	•
	Listed Building Consent	Grant Conditionally	13 January 2003
0830/02	Alterations to front access to sh steps to area adjacent to shop	•	amp access and
	Full Planning Permission	Grant Conditionally	13 January 2003
0746/02	Render front and west elevation	-	
	Listed Building Consent	•	
0715/01	Demolish shed/store attached to main building and rebuild as new kitchen, new bathroom and accommodation over existing kitchen, enclose area adjacent to back door to create office, stairs and store		
	Listed Building Consent	Refused	16 January 2002
0716/01	Shop expansion, catering stand accommodation	dard kitchen, office/stor	e, new staircase and
	Full Planning Permission	Refused	16 January 2002
3/26/221/98/07	Removal of exterior render & internal alterations		
	Listed Building Consent	Grant Conditionally	28 October 1998
3/26/252/97/07	Extension above annexe kitchen to provide office/study and new bathroom: provision of two new staircases; provision of toilet & washroom downstairs and alterations to doorways		
	Listed Building Consent	Grant Conditionally	14 May 1998
3/26/253/97/03	First floor extension above ann	exe kitchen	
	Full Planning Permission	Grant Conditionally	14 May 1998
3/26/028/97/04	To use central reception room a Change of Use	as tea room (four table Grant Unconditionally	<b>u</b>
3/26/201/96/07	Internal alterations Listed Building Consent	Grant Unconditionally	15 October 1996

## 3 Consultations

- 3.1 West Devon Borough Council The Parish Council has nominated the Post Office and Stores as an Asset of Community Value. WDBC have 8 weeks to make the decision (by 17th August 2022)
- 3.2 County EEC Directorate No highways objection
- 3.3 Environment Agency Standing advice flood zone 1

3.4 DNP - Building Conservation Officer - Refusal due to the negative impact caused to designated heritage assets contrary to the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 as amended, NPPF Section 16, PG on Historic Environment Local Plan and the Dartmoor Local Plan, Design Guide and South Zeal Conservation Area Character Appraisal.

## 4 Parish/Town Council Comments

4.1 South Tawton PC - No comments received at the time of report

#### 5 Relevant Development Plan Policies

Strategic Policy 1.1 Delivering National Park purposes and protecting Dartmoor's Special Qualities.

Strategic Policy 1.2 Sustainable development in Dartmoor National Park. Strategic Policy 1.3 Spatial Strategy. Strategic Policy 1.5 Delivering good design. Policy 1.7 Protecting local amenity in Dartmoor National Park. Strategic Policy 2.7 Conserving and enhancing heritage assets. Strategic Policy 3.2 Size and accessibility of new housing. Strategic Policy 4.1 Supporting community services and facilities. Strategic Policy 5.1 Non-residential Business and Tourism Development. Strategic Policy 5.3 Protecting Active Uses in Dartmoor's Settlements.

#### 6 Observations

#### PROPOSAL

6.1 It is proposed to change the use of the shop, post office and café to residential use in association with the main dwelling. All rooms subject to the proposed change are on the ground floor. The proposed internal alterations are limited to the removal of the existing shop counter which is centrally located within the building. Externally it is proposed to remove the shop sign and projecting blind.

#### NATIONAL PLANNING POLICY

- 6.2 Paragraph 84 of the National Planning Policy Framework states that to support rural economies planning decisions should enable the retention and development of accessible local services and community facilities, such as local shops.
- 6.3 Paragraph 93 states that to promote healthy and safe communities planning decisions should guard against the unnecessary loss of valued facilities and services, particularly where this would reduce the community's ability to meet its day-to-day needs... and... ensure that established shops, facilities and services are able to develop and modernise, and are retained for the benefit of the community.
- 6.4 Paragraph 197 states that in determining applications, local planning authorities should take account of:
  - a) the desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of heritage assets and putting them to viable uses consistent with their conservation;
  - b) the positive contribution that conservation of heritage assets can make to sustainable communities including their economic vitality; and

c) the desirability of new development making a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness.

LOCAL PLAN POLICY

6.5 The following Local Plan policies are relevant in the assessment of this application:

Strategic Policy 1.1 Delivering National Park purposes and protecting Dartmoor'special Qualities

Strategic Policy 1.2 Sustainable development in Dartmoor National Park

Strategic Policy 1.3 Spatial Strategy

Strategic Policy 1.5 Delivering good design

Policy 1.7 Protecting local amenity in Dartmoor National Park

Strategic Policy 2.7 Conserving and enhancing heritage assets

Strategic Policy 3.2 Size and accessibility of new housing

Strategic Policy 4.1 Supporting community services and facilities

Strategic Policy 5.1 Non-residential Business and Tourism Development

Strategic Policy 5.3 Protecting Active Uses in Dartmoor's Settlements

Strategic Policy 1.2 seeks to support sustainable development by, amongst others, providing essential services and infrastructure, and promotes and enables travel by public transport, cycle or foot.

Strategic Policy 2.7 requires all development to conserve and/or enhance heritage assets and their settings through appropriate assessment of harm.

Strategic Policy 3.2 states that all new housing should meet and not significantly exceed nationally described technical housing standards.

Strategic Policy 4.1 and its supporting text states that existing community services and facilities including commercial enterprises such as shops, post offices and other Assets of Community Value will be protected and development involving the whole or partial loss of community services and facilities will only be permitted where evidence demonstrates: a) there is no community need; b) there is equivalent provision elsewhere which meets the community's needs; or c) the service and/or facility is not viable.

Strategic Policy 5.1 advises that existing business and employment sites and premises will be retained for economic uses and that where proposals involving the loss of existing employment sites and premises will be carefully assessed to ensure the National Park's business and industry needs would not be harmed by the proposal. Strategic Policy 5.3 instructs that permission will not be granted within a classified settlement for a proposal that involves the loss of the last general store, shop or public house unless evidence submitted demonstrates the property has been offered for sale, rent and/or lease on the open market for the existing use or, in the case of Town Centres, main town centre uses, for a continuous period of at least 12 months, at a realistic price.

## PUBLIC COMMENTS

6.6 South Tawton Parish Council had not responded at the time of report. Any comments that are received will be reported at the meeting.

## 6.7 Number of objections: 61

Summary of issues raised:

- The shop and post office are a valuable community resource
- Elderly residents would be unduly harmed by loss
- Petrol price rise means local services required more than ever
- The stock levels have been depleted
- The site supports outreach post office in other villages
- The owner has lost enthusiasm
- The opening hours are too short/inflexible
- A house would result in more parking on road
- The asking price is too high
- No for sale sign on the building
- 6.8 Number of support: 4

Summary of issues raised:

- The residents do not provide enough custom
- Shop has been on market for a long time with no offers
- No issues with change to house

General observation: 1 - If the shop were open before 0900 it would increase custom.

ASSET OF COMMUNITY VALUE

- 6.9 The Parish Council has nominated the Post Office and Stores as an Asset of Community Value (ACV). West Devon Borough Council are considering whether to accept the nomination and include the site on the list of community assets. A decision is due by 17 August 2022.
- 6.10 An Asset of Community Value (ACV) is a building or other type of land which furthers the social wellbeing or social interests of the local community or could do so in the future. The Localism Act 2011 introduced a right for communities to bid for land or buildings which are determined by the Local Authority to be of community value.
- 6.11 An ACV listing does not place any restriction on what an owner can do with their property, once listed, if it remains in their ownership. However, the listing of a site as an ACV can be a material consideration in determining whether or not to grant planning permission for a change of use. In this case, as the ACV application is currently at nomination stage, officers consider limited weight should be attributed to this process however it does demonstrate a clear intention and desire within the community for the stores to be retained.

LOSS OF COMMUNITY FACILITY/SHOP/POST OFFICE

6.12 The Stores is centrally located within South Zeal with an active frontage on the main road through the village. It is both a retail outlet and registered post office, as well as a café. In addition to the post office service provided within the shop the contract with the post office also requires the operation of three outreach post offices in the following locations in Belstone, Sticklepath and Throwleigh. It is not known whether the outreach

service would be transferred to another post office should operations at South Zeal cease.

- 6.13 The strategic Communities, Services and Infrastructure chapter (4) of the Local Plan describes 'Community services and facilities' as being social and cultural services and facilities which support the social well-being of the community as a whole, or a substantial portion of it and states that they can include commercial enterprises such as pubs and post offices.
- 6.14 Strategic Policy 4.1 advises development involving the whole or partial loss of community services and facilities will only be permitted where evidence demonstrates:a) there is no community need; b) there is equivalent provision elsewhere which meets the community's needs; or c) the service and/or facility is not viable. These are addressed below:

#### (a) Community need

The extent of the response to the public consultation clearly identifies that there is a desire within the community for the stores to remain active within the village and beyond where post office the outreach services are provided.

#### (b) Equivalent provision elsewhere

There are alternative general stores located in Sticklepath (1km), Whitehouse Services (3.5km) and Whiddon Down (5km). None of these stores provide post office services throughout the week and all would be likely reliant on use of a car to access, with the exception perhaps of the Sticklepath store for those houses located on the western edge of the village.

#### (c) Service not viable

The application is accompanied by profit and loss accounts showing trading since 2016 to the present day. A letter from a local firm of accountants is also provided advising that the store has not made a profit since 2018, with the income from the post office salary supplementing income to an increasing degree. It is clear that the business overall has been struggling to support an income in the recent years, with the covid pandemic having a significant impact on trading. What is less clear is whether the business has suffered solely due to external factors or if it has also been impacted by the decisions made and current owner's business model, as suggested by a number of the public comments and indeed refuted in the applicant's response. In the absence of an independent assessment of the facility's potential it is difficult for officers to pass judgement on this matter and it is considered that additional information is required before a conclusion can be reached to establish whether, for example, a change in the business operating hours or a focus on a different retail offer might be sufficient to engage the community and sustain the business in the longer term.

- 6.15 The strategic Economy chapter (5) of the Local Plan recognises that there are challenges to Dartmoor's economy, including changing consumer preferences such as online shopping and home delivery (a trend accelerated through the covid pandemic and beyond), but also the importance of retaining active uses in settlements to ensure vibrant communities remain.
- 6.16 Strategic Policy 5.1 seeks to ensure that existing business sites are retained to ensure that business needs with the National Park would not be harmed by development. The business at the stores directly supports one full time and one part time member of staff

however it also contributes towards wider offer of services available in the village, which includes two pubs and a school.

- 6.17 Strategic Policy 5.3 requires any business operating as the last general store in any settlement in the National Park to carry out appropriate marketing for a period in excess of 12 months at a realistic price. A full description of what constitutes appropriate 'marketing evidence' is set out in the glossary, but includes as a minimum:
  - appointment of a qualified and experienced agent;
  - marketing at a realistic price or rent;
  - erection of a prominent signboard on the site;
  - production of agent's particulars/brochure; and
  - website entry appropriate to the use.
- 6.18 The supporting information shows that the property has been offered for sale as a going concern with a commercial agent since April 2019. It was originally marketed at an asking price of £575,000 plus stock. A total of two viewings took place and no offers were made. In September 2021 the asking price was increased to £650,000 plus stock. No viewings and no offers have been received.
- 6.19 The property is reported to have been advertised directly via the agent's website and through a number of other websites specialising in the sale of commercial property. It was not displayed on RightMove and was not listed with a local estate agent. Furthermore, no signboard was erected at the site.
- 6.20 It is also understood that throughout the marketing of the property the accommodation on offer included the store/post office/café and the owner's accommodation; at no time has the business premises been offered independent from the house.
- 6.21 While it is acknowledged that the property has been on the market for an extensive period of time, officers consider that the marketing strategy has been flawed for the following reasons: (i) the asking price both the initial and revised appears to have been largely based on the residential value of the site and does not/did not reflect the health of the business aspect of the site (ii) the marketing strategy was too narrow and restricted opportunity for local interest (iii) there was/is no flexibility offered in the marketing details to allow for the business to operate independent from the residential use.

IMPACT ON HERITAGE ASSET

- 6.22 The proposed development would have an impact on designated heritage assets in the form of the South Zeal conservation area and the grade II listed building and has accordingly been appraised against the relevant paragraphs in the NPPF, Strategic Policy 2.7 of the Local Plan and the South Zeal Conservation Area Appraisal.
- 6.23 The site has been in use as a merchant's house and premises since before 1844 (Tithe Apportionment) for the storage and selling of goods, when the land was owned by Henry Arthur Hoare, Esq and run and occupied by George Westaway as part of the Battershays Steer Estate. White's Directory of 1850 states that Westaway is a Carrier, transporter of goods (sometimes people). The area covered by the business includes much of the area now occupied by the school extension. The Tithe Map (1847) shows the front range of buildings as two dwelling houses, the fenestration pattern of the front

elevation also indicates that at the time of refronting (prior to the recoating with lime render c. 2002 (application ref. 0746/02)) it was in use as two separate dwellings, note also the separate entrance door on the north elevation. The First Edition OS Map also shows this arrangement, the break being at the northern line of the cross passage.

- 6.24 The proposed change of use would remove the business use of the property with which it has been associated for perhaps more than 200 years. This would have a negative impact on the historic interest of the listed property. This would also have a negative impact on the character and appearance of the Conservation Area, this being a busy corner of the village with both the school and shop/post office.
- 6.25 It is considered that the proposed change of use and works, including the removal of the shop counter, sign and blind, would cause less than substantial harm to the significance of the building and the character of the South Zeal conservation area and in the absence of any identified public benefit to outweigh the harm identified, it would be contrary to Strategic Policy 2.7.

#### SUMMARY

- 6.26 The proposed development would result in the loss of an important community facility. The community response to the application indicates that there is an overwhelming desire to retain the shop and post office and this has resulted in the nomination of the site as a ACV which would, if approved, provide an opportunity for the community to bid for ownership of the business.
- 6.27 While it is acknowledged that there has been a clear downward trend in the business which has affected viability it is has not been satisfactorily demonstrated through the application that this has been solely or substantially due to external market pressures. Neither has sufficient information been submitted to demonstrate that the business has been marketed at a realistic price for a reasonable period of time. It has clearly been the intention of the owner for the business and owners accommodation to be sold as one, as opposed to separate entities, which appears to have conflated these issues.
- 6.28 There are obviously important heritage considerations to any change to the way the building might be used or occupied given the status of the building as grade II listed however at this point officers have not been presented with enough information to determine whether there is a realistic opportunity for the two uses to operate successfully, independently from each other.

Item 7

Application No:	0206/22	District/Borough:	West Devon Borough
Application Type:	Listed Building Consent	Parish:	South Tawton
Grid Ref:	SX651935	Officer:	Oliver Dorrell
Proposal:	Works to facilitate a change of use of shop, cafe and post office counter to residential accommodation as part of the existing dwelling		
Location:	The Stores, South Zeal		
Applicant:	Mr & Mrs Hill		
Recommendation:	That, subject to the consideration of any comments from the South Tawton PC, consent be REFUSED		

#### Reason(s) for Refusal

1. The proposed works would cause less than substantial harm to the significance of a grade II listed building which, in the absence of any identified public benefit to outweigh the harm identified, would be contrary to policy SP2.7 of the Dartmoor Local Plan, the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 as amended, the advice contained in the English National Parks and the Broads UK Government Vision and Circular 2010 and the National Planning Policy Framework 2021.

#### 1 Introduction

- 1.1 This application concerns the building known as 'The Stores' in South Zeal. The building is two storey comprises a shop, post office and café on the ground floor and residential accommodation above. It is grade II listed.
- 1.2 The site is located on the corner of the main village road and Tawton Lane in the centre of the village and the South Zeal conservation area. The chapel of St Mary's (grade II) is to the east and the Oxenham Arms pub (grade II\*) is opposite.
- 1.3 This application is brought to Development Management Committee for determination due to the level of public interest and policy implications.

## 2 Planning History

0897/06	Barn conversion to studio		
	Listed Building Consent	Grant Conditionally	02 May 2007
0896/06	Barn conversion to studio		
	Full Planning Permission	Grant Conditionally	02 May 2007

0790/05 Barn conversion to holiday accommodation	
Full Planning Permission Refused 22 November 2005	
0791/05 Barn conversion to holiday accommodation	
Listed Building Consent Refused 22 November 2005	
0001/03 Demolish old shed attached to kitchen wall and re-build kitchen,	. attach
lean-to storeroom to kitchen and lean-to passage to connect two	
extension above existing kitchen	-,
Full Planning Permission Grant Conditionally 11 February 200	03
0002/03 Demolish old shed attached to existing kitchen wall and re-build	
attach lean-to storeroom to kitchen and lean-to passage to conr	
first floor extension above existing kitchen	
Listed Building Consent Grant Conditionally 11 February 200	03
0831/02 Alterations to front access to shop to create disabled ramp acce	
steps down to area adjacent to shop window	
Listed Building Consent Grant Conditionally 13 January 2003	3
0830/02 Alterations to front access to shop to create disabled ramp acce	ess and
steps to area adjacent to shop window	
Full Planning Permission Grant Conditionally 13 January 2003	
0746/02 Render front and west elevations with a single coat of lime rend	
	mber 2002
0715/01 Demolish shed/store attached to main building and rebuild as ne	
new bathroom and accommodation over existing kitchen, enclose	se rea
adjacent to back door to create office, stairs and store	
Listed Building Consent Refused 16 January 2002	
0716/01 Shop expansion, catering standard kitchen, office/store, new sta	aircase and
accommodation	
Full Planning Permission Refused 16 January 2002	
3/26/221/98/07 Removal of exterior render & internal alterations	or 1009
Listed Building Consent Grant Conditionally 28 Octob 3/26/252/97/07 Extension above annexe kitchen to provide office/study a	
bathroom: provision of two new staircases; provision of to	
washroom downstairs and alterations to doorways	Unet &
Listed Building Consent Grant Conditionally 14 May 1	008
3/26/253/97/03 First floor extension above annexe kitchen	990
Full Planning Permission Grant Conditionally 14 May 1	1998
3/26/028/97/04 To use central reception room as tea room (four tables se	
sixteen)	outing
Change of Use Grant Unconditionally 5 March 19	997
3/26/201/96/07 Internal alterations	
	October 1996

#### 3 Consultations

- 3.1 West Devon Borough Council The Parish Council have nominated the Post Office and Stores as an Asset of Community Value. WDBC has 8 weeks to make the decision (by 17th August 2022)
- 3.2 County EEC Directorate No highways objection
- 3.3 Environment Agency Standing advice flood zone 1

3.4 DNP - Building Conservation - Refusal due to the negative impact caused to designated Officer - heritage assets contrary to the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 as amended, NPPF Section 16, PG on Historic Environment Local Plan, and the Dartmoor Local Plan, Design Guide and South Zeal Conservation Area Character Appraisal.

#### 4 Parish/Town Council Comments – South Tawton Parish Council

4.1 No comments received at the time of report. Any comments that are received will be reported at the meeting.

#### 5 Observations

#### PROPOSAL

- 5.1 This proposal relates alterations to the shop, post office and café. Internally they limited to the removal of the existing shop counter which is centrally located within the building. Externally it is proposed to remove the shop sign and projecting blind. All rooms subject to the proposed change are on the ground floor.
- 5.2 The works are proposed in connection with a proposal to change the use of the shop, post office and café to residential use in association with the main dwelling which is subject to a separate planning application ref: 0205/22.

#### NATIONAL PLANNING POLICY

Paragraph 197 states that in determining applications, local planning authorities should take account of:

- a) the desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of heritage assets and putting them to viable uses consistent with their conservation;
- b) the positive contribution that conservation of heritage assets can make to sustainable communities including their economic vitality; and
- c) the desirability of new development making a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness.

LOCAL PLAN POLICY

5.3 The following Local Plan policies are relevant in the assessment of this application:

Strategic Policy 1.1 Delivering National Park purposes and protecting Dartmoor's Special Qualities

Strategic Policy 1.2 Sustainable development in Dartmoor National Park

Strategic Policy 1.5 Delivering good design

Strategic Policy 2.7 Conserving and enhancing heritage assets

Strategic Policy 2.7 requires all development to conserve and/or enhance heritage assets and their settings through appropriate assessment of harm.

#### PUBLIC COMMENTS

5.4 South Tawton Parish Council had not responded at the time of report. Any comments that are received will be reported at the meeting.

5.5 Number of objections: 61

Summary of issues raised:

- The shop and post office are a valuable community resource
- Elderly residents would be unduly harmed by loss
- Petrol price rise means local services required more than ever
- The stock levels have been depleted
- The site supports outreach post office in other villages
- The owner has lost enthusiam
- The opening hours are too short/inflexible
- A house would result in more parking on road
- The asking price is too high
- No for sale sign on the building
- 5.5 Number of support: 4

Summary of issues raised:

- The residents do not provide enough custom
- Shop has been on market for a long time with no offers
- No issues with change to house
- 5.6 General observation: 1 - If the shop were open before 0900 it would increase custom.

IMPACT ON HERITAGE ASSET

- 5.7 The proposed development would have an impact on a designated heritage asset in the form of a grade II listed building and has been accordingly been appraised against the relevant paragraphs in the NPPF, Strategic Policy 2.7 of the Local Plan and the South Zeal Conservation Area Appraisal.
- 5.8 The site has been in use as a merchant's house and premises since before 1844 (Tithe Apportionment) for the storage and selling of goods, when the land was owned by Henry Arthur Hoare, Esq and run and occupied by George Westaway as part of the Battershays Steer Estate. White's Directory of 1850 states that Westaway is a Carrier, transporter of goods (sometimes people). The area covered by the business includes much of the area now occupied by the school extension. The Tithe Map (1847) shows the front range of buildings as two dwelling houses, the fenestration pattern of the front elevation also indicates that at the time of refronting (prior to the recoating with lime render c. 2002 (application ref. 0746/02)) it was in use as two separate dwellings, note also the separate entrance door on the north elevation. The First Edition OS Map also shows this arrangement, the break being at the northern line of the cross passage.
- 5.9 The associated proposed change of use would remove the business use of the property with which it has been associated for perhaps more than 200 years. This would have a negative impact on the historic interest of the listed property. This would also have a negative impact on the character and appearance of the Conservation Area, this being a busy corner of the village with both the school and shop/post office.

5.10 It is considered that the proposed works, including the removal of the shop counter, sign and blind, would cause less than substantial harm to the significance of the building and the character of the South Zeal conservation area and in the absence of any identified public benefit to outweigh the harm identified, it would be contrary to Strategic Policy 2.7.

CHRISTOPHER HART



Dartmoor National Park Authority Development Management Committee

## 29 July 2022

## Tree Preservation Orders, Section 211 Notifications (Works to Trees in Conservation Areas) and Hedgerow Removal Notices Determined Under Delegated Powers

Report of the Trees and Landscape Officer

Recommendation: That the decisions be noted.

TPO APPLICATIONS

Teignbridge

Ref: 22/0008

Pitt Park, Widecombe

SX 7224 7830

Application to fell two Western red cedar trees. The trees are mostly hidden from view and the felling will have minimal impact on the amenity of the area. Consent was granted subject to conditions:

- 1. Five working days' notice to be given to the Authority prior to the commencement of approved works.
- 2. Replacement planting of two standard apple trees within the crown spread of the originals during the first planting season following felling.

Ref: 22/00095 Hawkmoor Park, Bovey TraceySX 8017 8091

Application to reduce a pollard an oak tree. The works will reduce the risk of whole tree failure. Consent was granted subject to conditions:

- 1. Five working days' notice to be given to the Authority prior to the commencement of approved works.
- 2. All works are carried out in accordance with British Standard 3998:2010 Tree Work-Recommendations.

South Hams

Ref: 22/00053 Didworthy Cottages, South BrentSX 6842 6216

Application to reduce a lime tree. The works will reduce the risk of whole tree failure. Consent was granted subject to conditions:

- 1. Five working days' notice to be given to the Authority prior to the commencement of approved works.
- 2. All works are carried out in accordance with British Standard 3998:2010 Tree Work-Recommendations.

Ref: 22/0007Grange Green, BuckfastSX 7385 6740

Application to reduce the eastern stem on a beech tree. The works will have minimal impact on the health and appearance of the tree. Consent was granted subject to conditions:

- 1. Five working days' notice to be given to the Authority prior to the commencement of approved works.
- 2. All works are carried out in accordance with British Standard 3998:2010 Tree Work-Recommendations.

Ref: 22/0012 Grange Green, Buckfast SX 7385 6741

Application to reduce low lateral branches on a beech tree. The works will have minimal impact on the health and appearance of the tree. Consent was granted subject to conditions:

- 1. Five working days' notice to be given to the Authority prior to the commencement of approved works.
- 2. All works are carried out in accordance with British Standard 3998:2010 Tree Work-Recommendations.

Ref: 22/0010Bittaford Park, BittafordSX 6677 5678

Application to reduce overhanging branches from two oak trees. The works will have minimal impact on the health and appearance of the trees. Consent was granted subject to conditions:

- 1. Five working days' notice to be given to the Authority prior to the commencement of approved works.
- 2. All works are carried out in accordance with British Standard 3998:2010 Tree Work-Recommendations.

SECTION 211 NOTICES

Teignbridge

Ref: 22/0006 27a Plymouth Road, Buckfastleigh SX 7377 7659

Notification to cut back overhanging branches from a sycamore tree. The works will have minimal impact on the health or appearance of the tree.

A Tree Preservation Order has not been made.

Ref: 22/0011	Lower Hill Cottage, North Bovey	SX 7410 8381	
Notification to fell a silver birch tree. The tree is in very poor condition.			
A Tree Preservation Order has not been made.			
West Devon			
Ref: 22/0003	Aldenda, South Tawton	SX 6533 9450	
Notification to fell a beech tree and remove low branches over a garage. The works will have minimal impact on the character of the Conservation Area.			
A Tree Preservation Order has not been made.			
Ref: 22/0004	Meadowsyde, Throwleigh	SX 6693 9076	
Notification to pollard an ash tree. The tree has previously been pollarded and the works will have minimal impact on the character of the Conservation Area.			
A Tree Preservation Order has not been made.			
South Hams			
Ref: 22/00602	St Mary's Church, Throwleigh	SX 6677 9080	
Notification to fell an elm tree. The tree is showing signs of Dutch Elm Disease.			

A Tree Preservation Order has not been made.

**BRIAN BEASLEY**