# DARTMOOR NATIONAL PARK AUTHORITY

# DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE

# 11 January 2019

# APPLICATION FOR DETERMINATION BY THE COMMITTEE

#### Report of the Head of Development Management

#### INDEX

# Item Description

<u>No.</u>

- 1. 0561/18 Erection of office (Full Planning Permission), The Old Fire Station, Pg 14 Manor Road, Chagford
- 2. 0476/18 Development of four units of affordable housing (Full Planning Pg 22 Permission), Land adj to The Old Telephone Exchange, South Zeal
- 0475/18 Change of use from former Methodist Chapel (use D1) to single Pg 30 residential unit (C3) (Full Planning Permission), South Zeal Methodist Church, South Zeal

# 0561/18 - Old Fire Station, Chagford

Scale 1:1,000



Application No: 1. 0561/18 District/Borough: West Devon Borough Parish: Application Type: Full Planning Permission Chagford Grid Ref: Officer: SX698875 Helen Maynard Proposal: **Erection of office** Location: The Old Fire Station, Manor Road, Chagford Applicant: Mr M O'Connor

Recommendation That permission be GRANTED

# Condition(s)

- 1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.
- 2. The proposed development shall, in all respects, accord strictly with drawings: 398.4.200A valid 17 October 2018 and 398.1.200A received 5 October 2018.
- 3. Prior to installation, samples of all proposed surfacing, external facing and roofing materials shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for approval; thereafter unless otherwise agreed by the Local Planning Authority in writing, only approved surfacing, external facing and roofing materials shall be used in the development.
- 4. The Premises shall be used for A2 (Professional Services Architect's Office) purposes only and for no other purpose (including any other purpose in Class A2 of the Schedule to the Town and Country Planning (Use Classes) Order 1987 or in any provision equivalent to that Class in any statutory instrument revoking and re-enacting that Order with or without modification.
- 5. The business shall only operate in the premises during 'normal office hours' between the times of 08.00 and 18.00 Monday to Friday and 09.00 and 13.00 Saturdays. There shall be no working on Sundays, Bank or Public Holidays.
- 6. Unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority all external windows in the development shall be of dark coloured powder coated aluminium construction and shall at all times thereafter be retained as dark coloured powder coated aluminium framed windows.
- 7. All new external timber on the building hereby approved shall be stained dark brown or black, not later than 30 days after the substantial completion of the development. Prior to the application of any timber stain, a sample of the stained timber showing the timber stain proposed to be used shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for approval; at all times thereafter only the approved timber stain shall be used on external timber on the building unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- 8. The solar panels hereby approved shall be fitted with black outer frames, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- 9. Upon becoming redundant, the solar panels shall be removed within a period of six months.
- 10. Prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved, details of the proposed (sewage disposal)(surface water drainage) works to serve the development shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for approval. Implementation of the (sewage disposal)(surface water drainage works) shall be strictly in accordance with the approved details.

11. Prior to the commencement of the development hereby permitted, details of the proposed landscaping and planting scheme shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for approval. The landscaping and planting shall be carried out in accordance with the approved scheme within twelve months of the commencement of the development, or such longer period as the Local Planning Authority shall specify in writing. The landscaping and planting shall be maintained for a period of not less than five years from the date of the commencement of the development, such maintenance shall include the replacement of any trees or shrubs that die or are removed.

# Introduction

The site is currently a grassy bank that forms part of the site of the old fire station. The site is located on the edge of, but outside, the Chagford Conservation Area boundary. This application proposes a two-storey office building.

This application is a re-submission following refusal of application ref 0101/18. It seeks to address the reason for refusal on the previous application; namely scale, massing and design.

The application is presented to the Committee in view of the Parish Council's comments.

A decision on this application was deferred at the Committee meeting on 7 December 2018. Supplementary comments from the Head of Development Management are included at the end of this report.

# **Planning History**

0101/18	Erection of office		
	Full Planning Permission	Refused	11 May 2018
0656/15	Erection of an office		
	Full Planning Permission	Withdrawn	03 February 2016
3/08/188/96/03	Erection of a single dwelling		
	Full Planning Permission	Refused	05 November 1996
3/08/174/95/03	Erection of a single dwelling		
	Full Planning Permission	Refused	04 September 1995

# Consultations

Environment Agency:	Flood zone 1. Standing advice applies.
West Devon Borough Council:	Does not wish to comment.
County EEC Directorate:	No objection.

# **Parish/Town Council Comments**

Chagford PC: Object. The 20% reduction in size is not enough change for the Parish Council to support this application, loss of green space and sight lines. Concerns over no parking on site. If planning was granted it would generate more traffic and parking issues on a busy road in this area of the town.

#### **Relevant Development Plan Policies**

- **COR1 Sustainable Development Principles**
- COR18 Providing for sustainable economic growth
- **COR2** Settlement Strategies
- DMD19 Sustainable Communities
- DMD1a Presumption in favour of sustainable development
- DMD1b Delivering National Park purposes and protecting Dartmoor National
- Park's special qualities
- DMD3 Sustaining the quality of places in Dartmoor National Park
- DMD4 Protecting local amenity
- DMD41 Parking provision Non Residential
- DMD5 National Park Landscape
- DMD7 Dartmoor's built environment

# Representations

59 letters of objection 15 letters of support

Objections

- Residential area; not appropriate for a business use
- Building is too large
- Not appropriate site for a building
- Lack of parking provision
- Dangerous access
- Building resembles a church
- Ugly building
- Should be left as green space
- Dangerous due to lack of visibility down road
- No need, Squirrel Design already has an office
- Potential future change of use
- Traffic problems on Manor Road
- Overdevelopment of site
- The design is too modern
- Ground stability concerns
- Other buildings available
- Sewer capacity could be affected

Supporting comments

- Local family business who support the town
- Investment into the town
- No parking issues with existing office
- Not amenity land, privately owned
- Well proportioned building
- Plenty of green space on Dartmoor elsewhere
- Income and employment locally
- Application meets planning policy
- Design issues in previous refusal have been addressed.

# Observations

PROPOSAL SUMMARY

This application proposes the erection of a 66sqm two storey office building for Squirrel Design.

The site fronts Manor Road. It is a steeply sloping grassed verge with a tarmac footway alongside the road.

Squirrel Design are an established Architectural practice who have been operating in Chagford for over 25 years. The existing business is located at basement level in the dwelling known as 2 Old Fire Station, Chagford. The existing space comprises a small open plan office suitable for two employees with meeting table in the centre. This application has been submitted to allow the business to grow and allow the occupants to take advantage of the living accommodation at basement level at 2 Old Fire Station.

# PLANNING HISTORY

An application for a similar proposal was submitted in 2015 (ref: 0656/15). This application was for a new office building in the same location. The principle of having an office building in this location was accepted during this application, however the application was withdrawn as Officers had concerns regarding the design of the building. The applicant has engaged with the Officers and through the pre-application process has altered the design to remain more inkeeping with the locality.

A subsequent application proposed a flat roof single storey building (to the rear - facing 1 The Old Fire Station) with dual pitch two-storey element fronting Manor Road. (ref: 0101/18) that was refused permission at the Development Management Committee on 4 May 2018.

# CURRENT PROPOSAL

This application seeks to address the refusal reason of 0101/18. This revised submission seeks a reduction in the footprint and overall volume of the proposal. The volume of the proposal has been reduced by 20%. The ridge has been re-aligned to be perpendicular to the garage at Number 1 The Old Fire Station, as opposed to parallel with the road, this has the positive effect on the site by creating space for additional planting and landscaping and moves the ridge line further from both the road and Number 1 The Old Fire Station.

# **KEY POLICY CONSIDERATIONS**

The policy considerations are similar to those set out in application 0101/18.

# PRINCIPLE OF BUSINESS USE

Local Plan policy COR18 provides support for small scale business opportunities that are compatible with National Park purposes. Within designated settlements policy recognises the opportunity to develop and expand existing businesses and offers support for creative small scale development aimed at light industrial/office based uses. The object of this policy is to direct employment opportunities to sustainable locations within or near to existing settlements.

The site is located within the Local Centre of Chagford, and it is within the settlement boundary, where one could expect to see new business premises located. The proposal to establish a new office building to assist in the growth of the existing business is justified in this location.

The development of an office building for an established architectural practice (incorporating workspace and meeting space) would not conflict with the above policies and is a development principle that officers support.

# **DESIGN & IMPACT ON BUILT ENVIRONMENT**

The Government attaches great importance to the design of the built environment within the National Planning Policy Framework, establishing good design as a key aspect of sustainable development. Permission should be refused for development of poor design that fails to take the opportunities available for improving the character and quality of an area and the way it functions.

Policies COR1, COR3, COR4, DMD1b, DMD3 and DMD7 require new development to provide high quality, locally distinctive design that conserves and enhances the character and appearance of the built environment of the Dartmoor National Park. Specifically, policy DMD7 requires new development to reinforce locally distinctive qualities of place through consideration of open spaces, uses, scale, height, alignment and design. This is reiterated in the Design Guide.

The site lies to the east of the village centre outside, but adjacent to the Conservation Area. The site was previously the Old Fire Station - a corrugated metal dual pitched roof building from which the design of this proposal has been informed. The site occupies a small plot of land flanking directly onto Manor Drive. In order to provide a viable building with office, meeting space and storage provision a two-storey building is proposed. The narrow site constraints and proximity to other buildings, mostly dwellings have informed the plan of the building. The proposed development would present a more dominant building than the currently vacant site, however, the detail and design proposed is high quality and would not detract from the character and appearance of the area (having regard to the scale of surrounding buildings and topography); would not harm the Conservation Area and would secure this site, within the local centre, with a new viable use to help support a local business.

A number of neighbours and the Parish Council have submitted comments raising concerns about the scale and size of the building. The proposed building has, however, been reduced in size and volume and designed with windows facing away from neighbouring properties and the juxtaposition of respective buildings, and levels, is such that there should be no overbearing or loss of light. The size of the building has been justified by the applicant and is considered to be within the policy requirements of COR18 in terms of small scale business expansion.

# HIGHWAY SAFETY

No parking or vehicular access is proposed for this office . The Highway Authority has no objection to the proposal. A number of representations have noted parking and vehicular movement as a concern in this application. This small scale office is unlikely to produce a large volume of traffic and it is considered that there is adequate parking available within the Chagford Local Centre. Enforcement of 'illegal' parking is a separate issue, not a planning consideration related to this application.

Local Centres are considered to be a sustainable location. Policy DMD41 sets out the parking provision for new non residential development. For staff a maximum of 1 space is required per 100sqm floorspace. The proposed development is less than 100sqm therefore no parking

provision is required by this policy. 1 space is required per 14sqm for visitors. In this case, this equates to a maximum of 5 parking spaces. These can easily be accommodated within Chagford's existing parking provision or at the property known as 2 Old Fire Station.

# SURFACE WATER DRAINAGE AND FLOODING

The proposed development falls within the less vulnerable flood risk classification and would be an appropriate use in this location

Policy DMD3 requires development to dispose of surface water in accordance with sustainable methods to minimise risk of flooding and pollution of watercourses. A surface water drainage strategy will be secured by condition to ensure that the proposal does not lead to increased flooding elsewhere.

# CONCLUSION

On balance, the proposal is considered to present a sustainable form of development. It is of a scale and form that respects its location and is a high quality design solution that will be a positive addition to this part of the settlement. The application is therefore recommended for approval subject to appropriate conditions.

HEAD OF DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT COMMENTS - January 2019

A decision on this application was deferred at the Committee meeting on 7 December 2018. Members requested further commentary on various aspects of the proposal to inform a decision.

# CHAGFORD DESIGN STATEMENT (2009)

The Chagford Design Group brought together representatives of the Parish Council, business community and residents of Chagford to consider what was important to preserve and enhance Chagford and its amenities.

The stated vision was "to ensure Chagford remains economically viable with a vibrant community spirit". At the heart of that document was desire to meet three objectives, namely;

-Greater local employment -Attracting more visitors -Enhancing community spirt

In respect of local employment opportunities there was a strong level of community support reflecting the desire to maintain existing shops and businesses and provide new facilities to 'cater for small and medium size business development' to include 'serviced central office facilities, local storage and distribution, local trades and manufacture as well as existing business types'.

The Design Statement was the catalyst for the Masterplan exercise led by the Prince's Trust for the comprehensive development of the Bellacouch Meadow allocated site on the eastern approach to the village. Members will appreciate that there is now an extant planning permission for new employment space on that allocated site (175sqm of B1 class light industrial/office space). Work has yet to commence on that unit.

Future aspirations set out in the recently publicised draft Local Plan envisage an allocation of employment land at Crannaford's on the eastern approach to the village. There is also commentary on the aspiration to ensure the continued viability of town centre locations. At this time the draft plan should not influence planning decisions.

# CURRENT POLICY BACKGROUND

The site lies wholly within the defined settlement boundary of the Local Centre. The current vision for Chagford amongst other objectives seeks to sustain a 'vibrant local service economy'.

# Policy COR 18 states that;

'Local employment and business opportunities will be sustained by the provision of new employment sites within and adjoining the Local Centres where there is evidence that demand cannot be met by existing or permitted sites'. It goes on to provide support for the 'controlled expansion and development of existing businesses' and 'support for small scale development needed to facilitate the establishment of office, light industrial, service and creative industries and home based enterprises'.

The proposal fits comfortably with this policy aspiration. There can be no reasonable agreement that the principle cannot be supported in this location. It is a type of use compatible with a sustainable location adjacent to the town centre and residential properties.

With regard to size, the proposal is for a modest 66sqm of office floor area. That falls well below any threshold for the need to apply sequential assessments to the development.

Under the current policy background there is positive support for proposals of this nature.

# **HIGHWAY SAEFTY/PARKING**

The report rehearses these arguments in detail. While there is strength of local feeling and a longstanding acknowledgement of parking issues within the village, in the absence of concerns regarding highway safety, this would be an unsubstantiated reason for refusal.

# DESIGN

This is the area that has some degree of subjectivity. Guidance for applicants should be based on the Dartmoor Design Guide. While this does not prescribe solutions it encourages adherence to local traditions and distinctiveness. This can be translated into contemporary solutions which can sit comfortably with historic context. This site lies outside of the defined Conservation Area but nevertheless is a site in the public realm. It is adjacent to recently built dwellings of their period. While this is an area that can polarise opinion it would be necessary to demonstrate 'harm' rather than the strict tests of 'preserving and enhancing' that would apply to a site within the adjacent Conservation Area. The balanced assessment is that the building has its own style which is neither pastiche or overtly modern. The use of traditional slate and stone facades helps to knit the development into its wider surroundings.

In summary, local concerns are recognised and acknowledged in this case. A decision on the application at hand must be based on adopted local policy. That policy points to a recommendation of support for the proposal. To deviate from that position without well-reasoned evidence would, in this case, be difficult to substantiate.

# 0476/18 - Land adj Old Telephone Exchange, South Zeal

Scale 1:1,250





Application No: Application Type: Grid Ref:	0476/18 Full Planning Permission SX648938	District/Borough: Parish: Officer:	West Devon Borough South Tawton Jo Burgess
Proposal:	Development of four units of a	ffordable housin	g
Location:	Land adj to The Old Telephone Exchange, South Zeal		
Applicant:	Messrs Glover, Pearn, White & White		
Recommendation	That, subject to the completion	of a Section 10	6 legal agreement in

# respect of affordable housing, permission be GRANTED

# Condition(s)

2.

- 1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.
- The proposed development shall, in all respects, accord strictly with the site location plan and block plan received 3 September 2018, drawing number 1809-2 received 26 October 2018 and drawing number 1809-1 received 15 November 2018
- 3. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 2015 or any Order revoking and re-enacting that Order with or without modification, no material alterations to the external appearance of the building(s) shall be carried out and no extension, building, enclosure, structure, erection, hard surface, swimming or other pool shall be constructed or erected in or around the curtilage of the dwellings hereby permitted, and no windows or roof lights other than those expressly authorised by this permission shall be created, formed or installed, without the prior written authorisation of the Local Planning Authority.
- 4. No development shall take place until a Construction Method Statement to include details of :-
  - 1) parking for vehicles of site personnel, operatives and visitors
  - 2) loading and unloading of plant and materials
  - 3) storage of plant and materials
  - 4) programme of works (including phasing, measures for traffic management and vehicle wheel cleaning)
  - 5) provision of welfare facilities
  - 6) hours of working
  - 7) temporary screening of south west boundary

has been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The works shall, at all times accord with the agreed details unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

- 5. No development shall take place until details of the proposed landscaping and planting scheme have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The landscaping and planting shall be carried out in accordance with the approved scheme within twelve months of the commencement of the development, or such longer period as the Local Planning Authority shall specify in writing. The landscaping and planting shall be maintained for a period of five years from the date of the commencement of the development, such maintenance shall include the replacement of any trees or shrubs that die or are removed.
- 6. No development shall take place until the detailed design of the proposed surface water drainage management system, including details of infiltration tests to inform the design of the proposed soakaway which will serve the development site, have been submitted to and approved in writing by, the Local Planning Authority. The surface water drainage management system must satisfactorily address both the rates and volumes, and quality of the surface water runoff from the site during construction and upon completion of the development.
- 7. No development shall take place until details of the proposed sewage treatment plant to serve the development have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The sewage treatment plant shall be provided strictly in accordance with the approved details and maintained thereafter.
- 8. Notwithstanding the drawings hereby approved, no development shall take place until details/samples of all proposed external facing materials, verges, cills, headers, plinths, solar panels, chimney pots and joinery have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority; thereafter unless otherwise agreed by the Local Planning Authority in writing, only approved external facing materials, verges, cills, headers, plinths, solar panels, chimney pots and joinery shall be used in the development.
- 9. No development shall take place until details of kerbing of the access drive and the surfacing and delineation of the parking space(s) for motor vehicles ('the parking') have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The access drive, access drainage, visibility splays and parking spaces, shall be constructed and finished strictly in accordance with the approved details. Thereafter the parking shall be made available for use and permanently retained for that use alone and shall be maintained in accordance with the approved details thereafter.
- <sup>10.</sup> All new external joinery shall receive a painted finish within one month of its installation unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- <sup>11.</sup> The roofs of the houses hereby approved shall be covered in natural slate, sample(s) of which shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for approval prior to the commencement of any roofing work. At all times thereafter the roofs shall be maintained in the approved natural slate.
- 12. The roofs of the houses hereby approved shall be covered in slate which shall be fixed by nailing only, unless otherwise previously agreed by the Local Planning Authority in writing.
- 13. Notwithstanding the drawings hereby approved, all gutters and downpipes on the development hereby approved shall be of metal construction and round or half-round in section and, unless otherwise agreed by the Local Planning Authority in writing, shall be painted black not later than 30 days after the substantial completion of the development.

- 14. All new stonework shall be laid and pointed using traditional techniques and materials. A sample panel shall be prepared for inspection by the Local Planning Authority and no stonework shall be carried out until the sample panel has been inspected, and approved by, the Local Planning Authority.
- 15. Unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority, the development hereby permitted shall be implemented strictly in accordance with the recommendations and requirements of the ecological survey report dated June 2018
- 16. Prior to the commencement of any works, demolition or development on the land, all existing trees, shrubs and hedges to be retained shall be protected by fences or suitable barriers erected beyond their dripline in accordance with the Arboricultural Report and Tree Protection Plan dated May 2018. Such fences or barriers shall be maintained until the completion of the development on the land.
- 17. No tree or hedge on the land (other than one permitted to be felled or removed as shown on the approved plans) shall be felled, lopped, topped, cut down or grubbed out without the prior written consent of the Local Planning Authority. Any tree or hedge removed without consent, or found to be dying, damaged or diseased, shall be replaced on a like for like basis unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- 18. Plot 1 shall not be occupied until details of a means of enclosure along the shared boundary with The Old Telephone Exchange, have been submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The approved means of enclosure shall be retained thereafter.

# Introduction

The site is on agricultural land adjacent to the Old Telephone Exchange on the edge of the village of South Zeal.

The application proposes four units of affordable housing to be erected as a self build project by four families with local connections.

The application is presented to Committee at the discretion of the Head of Development Management due to the site being considered an exception site on the edge of the Rural Settlement.

# **Planning History**

0902/07	New dwelling Full Planning		Grant Conditionally	20 May 2008
Consultations				
West Devon Bord	ough Council:	Does not wish to	comment	
County EEC Directorate:		The proposed access is adequate in respect of geometry and visibility to serve the proposed development so there are no objections from a highway safety point of view		
Environment Agency:		Flood Risk Zone 1 - standing advice applies		
DNP - Ecology & Wildlife Conservation:		Works to proceed in strict accordance with the recommendations and mitigation in the ecological impact assessment report (J.L Ecology, June 2018).		

West Devon Borough Council	The Housing Officer confirms that they are satisfied that
(Housing):	the application will meet local need and will be affordable
	properties for those wishing to build their own home.

#### **Parish/Town Council Comments**

South Tawton PC:	South Tawton Parish Council supports this application, provided that a Section 106 agreement is signed. The Council noted that it would like to see more of this kind of development, especially as it helps meet the needs outlined in the Housing Needs Report in 2014 (14 affordable housing units).

#### **Relevant Development Plan Policies**

- COR1 Sustainable Development Principles
- COR15 Providing for limited new housing to meet local needs
- **COR2** Settlement Strategies
- COR21 Dealing with development and transport issues in a sustainable way
- COR3 Protection of Dartmoor's special environmental qualities
- COR4 Design and sustainable development principles

COR7 - Providing for the conservation of Dartmoor's varied plant and animal life and geology

- DMD14 Biodiversity and geological conservation
- DMD1a Presumption in favour of sustainable development
- DMD1b Delivering National Park purposes and protecting Dartmoor National
- Park's special qualities
- DMD22 Residential development in Rural Settlements
- DMD3 Sustaining the quality of places in Dartmoor National Park
- DMD38 Access onto the highway
- DMD4 Protecting local amenity
- DMD40 Parking provision Residential
- DMD5 National Park Landscape
- DMD7 Dartmoor's built environment

#### Representations

2 letters of objection 7 letters of support 1 other letter

The majority of those who have made representations support the application on the basis that it is important to keep young people within the community and this is a great opportunity to self build when there is such a shortage of property in the affordable bracket in the Parish.

Those who object raise concerns regarding the justification for the houses and long term control over occupancy especially in view of the site being outside the village. The issue of loss of farmland is also raised.

#### Observations

INTRODUCTION

It is proposed to erect four three bedroom affordable dwellings to meet the needs of the four applicants, who fall within the definition of being in housing need. The site adjacent to the Old Telephone Exchange is agricultural land adjoining the settlement, owned by the family of the applicants.

# POLICY

Development Plan policy COR2 sets out a settlement hierarchy. Outside Local Centres and Rural Settlements, housing development will be restricted to that serving the proven needs of agriculture or through appropriate conversion of rural buildings to meet identified local needs for affordable housing (COR15).

In this case South Zeal is a Rural Settlement where open market housing would not be permitted. Policy DMD22 states that exceptionally where a specific parish need for affordable housing has been identified, then development tailored to meet those needs will be permitted on suitable land within or adjoining the settlement and well related to its existing built form.

The site is lies to north-west of the Old Telephone Exchange which was converted to residential use following the grant of planning permission in 2007 and opposite semi-detached properties in Cross Park on the road out of the village from Zeal Cross to South Tawton.

# PRE-APPLICATION ADVICE

This application was the subject of extensive pre application discussions with officers. In particular the relationship with the Telephone Exchange and protecting the amenity of the occupiers was discussed and the submitted layout addressed these concerns.

The applicants have all filled in the 'Self Build Register of Interest' forms and submitted them to the Devon Rural Housing Partnership. It has been confirmed that they are eligible in terms of being local, in housing need and financially qualifying for affordable housing.

The applicants are all aware of the requirements of the Section 106 Affordable Housing Agreement.

#### AFFORDABLE HOUSING

The development proposes two pairs of semi-detached three bedroom dwellings of 84.6sqm. This fits comfortably with the 84sqm quoted for a three bedroom four person two storey house in the DCLG Technical Housing Standards and within the 85sqm for a three bed dwelling quoted in the adopted DNP Affordable Housing SPD.

The applicants will be funding the project by obtaining mortgages through a specialist in self build mortgages.

The financial viability of the scheme has been carefully assessed. The properties have been valued by a local estate agent at £215,000 (open market value off plan). Taking into account the occupancy restriction and with the 20% reduction required in the legal agreement the value is therefore estimated at £139,750. The build costs per square metre have been estimated (on the basis of a detailed breakdown) to be £219.49 sqm. This is considered to be reasonable and at a level which would be affordable to local residents.

In this case as self builders there will be added 'sweat equity'. The biggest saving for the

project comes from the fact that the land is in the ownership of a family member, hence removing the cost of purchase from the equation.

# THE SITE

The ex-local authority houses on the south side of the road are set back from the highway. The proposed houses will be set back behind the Old Telephone Exchange with long gardens in a staggered arrangement behind the retained roadside hedge. This layout is proposed in order to protect the privacy of the residents of the Old Telephone Exchange who have minimal screening on their eastern boundary and windows facing in an easterly direction. There will be a central access between the two pairs of semis with 10 parking spaces and circulation space at the rear, with dwarf stone walls on either side of the curving drive

The ground rises to the north so the houses will be set into the slope of the land and the elevations facing the road will have patio doors to raised patios and the gardens. The access to the dwellings will be from the side with one bedroom and living accommodation being provided at ground floor level and at first floor level the roof extends over the ground floor so that only part of the first floor is habitable floor area providing a further two bedrooms.

The houses are simple with white smooth render walls, slate roofs, grey ridge tiles and white painted timber windows and doors. Stone walls are proposed to form the drive and landscaping is proposed within the parking/turning area at the rear. Existing trees on the boundary to the west are to be retained and a devon hedgebank will form the new site boundary to the rear with post and rail fencing separating gardens from each other and the retained field to the east.

The form and layout of the properties is considered to be acceptable and be well related to the existing built form of the settlement as required by policies DMD7 and DMD22.

# AMENITY

The Old Telephone Exchange currently enjoys an open view over the field which they reasonably expected to remain in agricultural use. The setting back of the houses and the levels mean that they will instead look over the gardens of the four properties. The patio of unit 1 will be approximately at the same level as the field currently is and the drive set behind the stone walls at a slightly lower level. No windows in the proposed properties will directly overlook the windows in the east elevation of the existing dwelling so on balance in the context of policy DMD4, the impact on residential amenity is considered to be acceptable. At present the occupiers of The Old Telephone Exchange enjoy an open aspect over the adjoining farmland, however a fence or wall along the boundary will be protect privacy between ground floor windows and what will be an adjacent garden and on that basis provided an appropriate fence or wall is provided on the boundary, that relationship is not considered to be grounds to object to the application.

# ACCESS

Access is to be gained via a new access which is considered to be adequate in respect of geometry and visibility to serve the proposed development.

# REPRESENTATIONS

There is considerable local support for the proposal. The concerns of the immediate

neighbour have been taken into account in the proposal and their amenity can be protected by means of a condition requiring the means of enclosure being agreed.

# CONCLUSION

The proposal has been the subject of considerable discussion with officers and the applicants have provided all the information required from them. It is clear that they are locals in housing need who are in a position to be able to provide themselves with new affordable dwellings on the edge of the village in an acceptable form which will not cause harm to the character and appearance of the National Park. The impact on the neighbours has been carefully considered and although it is acknowledged that the development will bring a considerable change to their outlook, the impact on residential amenity is minimal.

# 0475/18 - South Zeal Methodist Church

Scale 1:1,250



3.	Application No:	0475/18	District/Borough	West Devon Borough
	Application Type:	Full Planning Permission	Parish:	South Tawton
	Grid Ref:	SX654934	Officer:	Jo Burgess
	Proposal:	Change of use from former Me residential unit (C3)	thodist Chapel (	use D1) to single
	Location:	South Zeal Methodist Church, South Zeal		
	Applicant:	Oxenham Developments Ltd		

Recommendation That permission be REFUSED

# Reason(s) for Refusal

 The proposed development would result in an additional unjustified open market dwelling in a Rural Settlement, contrary to policies COR2, COR15 and DMD22 of the Dartmoor National Park Development Plan and the advice contained in the English National Parks and the Broads UK Government Vision and Circular 2010 and the National Planning Policy Framework 2018.

# Introduction

South Zeal Methodist Church is located within the Rural Settlement of South Zeal. It is an unlisted building within the South Zeal Conservation Area.

It is proposed to convert the church into a single four bedroom dwelling.

The application is presented to the committee in view of the Parish Council's comments and because it has been advertised as a Departure from the Development Plan.

# Consultations

Environment Agency: West Devon Borough Council: County EEC Directorate: DNP - Archaeology:	Flood Zone 1 - standing advice applies Does not wish to comment No highway implications No archaeological concerns
DNP - Building Conservation Officer:	Subject to conditions in respect of the door recess remaining the amended plans have addressed the majority of the concerns originally expressed. The expanded Statement of Significance provides an adequate assessment of the extent of the heritage impact and there are no objections to this application.
DNP - Ecology & Wildlife Conservation:	Works to proceed in strict accordance with the approved drawings and recommendations in the bat and breeding bird survey report (JG Ecological Surveys, Revision 2 Nov 2018).
	This should be a condition of any planning consent.

# **Parish/Town Council Comments**

South Tawton PC: The Parish Council supports this application but has som	South Tawton PC:	The Parish Council supports this application but has some
---	------------------	---

concerns about there not being enough parking provided for a four bedroom house as parking at this part of the village is already very difficult.

# **Relevant Development Plan Policies**

COR1 - Sustainable Development Principles

COR12 - Meeting the need for local infrastructure, community facilities and public services

COR15 - Providing for limited new housing to meet local needs

COR2 - Settlement Strategies

COR21 - Dealing with development and transport issues in a sustainable way

COR5 - Protecting the historic built environment

COR7 - Providing for the conservation of Dartmoor's varied plant and animal life and geology

DMD14 - Biodiversity and geological conservation

DMD19 - Sustainable Communities

DMD1a - Presumption in favour of sustainable development

DMD1b - Delivering National Park purposes and protecting Dartmoor National

Park's special qualities

DMD22 - Residential development in Rural Settlements

DMD8 - Changes to Historic Buildings

# Representations

2 letters of objection 2 other letters

One neighbour is largely in favour of the change of use from a chapel to a private dwelling. However there are concerns that parking provision isn't sufficient for a four bedroom property in a small village where there are already parking problems. They would like the look of the windows to stay the same but are happy with the additional downstairs window and blocking up of the lower ground floor external door and removal of the steps.

Other neighbours express concerns about clear glazing in the windows on the mezzanine floor stating that frosted glass needs to be higher as it has always has been in order that their privacy in the house and garden is not affected.

Concerns are also expressed regarding the construction period and possible impact on amenity.

# Observations

# INTRODUCTION

South Zeal Methodist Church is a prominent building at the south end of the village. As a former Methodist Chapel, it is recorded on the Historic Environment Record and constitutes a non-designated heritage asset located within the designated heritage asset which is the Conservation Area.

PRE-APPLICATION ADVICE

The applicant did not seek pre-application advice prior to purchasing the building, however following a meeting with the Building Conservation Officer, has amended the proposal to address his concerns in respect of the detail of the proposed conversion whilst also addressing ecological matters raised by the presence of bats in the building.

# THE PROPOSAL

Access to the building is via the front door at the upper level into the former chapel and via a side door into the rooms used for Sunday School and other activities at the lower level. The pews have been removed from the building but the raised alter area and pulpit remain but will be lost during the conversion.

It is proposed to close the door at the lower level to form a window, install a staircase to the upper level and install a mezzanine over part of the former chapel room to form one four bedroom dwelling. It is also proposed to remove a section of wall at the front of the building to form a car parking area.

# POLICY

South Zeal is a Rural Settlement where policy DMD22 states that no new open market housing should be permitted. 'All new housing will need to be affordable and ... provided through the acceptable conversion of an existing building'. This proposal is in conflict with this policy requirement.

The building is not listed but is an undesignated heritage asset therefore policy DMD8 applies. This allows for the change of use, extension or alteration of designated heritage assets where, having assessed the significance of the asset and whether the proposed development will result in harm to the asset, the Authority concludes that any harm identified is outweighed by the public benefits the proposed development will bring. In considering applications for non-designated heritage assets the policy requires the Authority to come to a balanced judgement having regard to the scale of any harm or loss and the significance of the asset.

The building also lies within the South Zeal Conservation Area which is a designated heritage asset and where policy DMD12 requires that development will only be permitted where the character and appearance of the conservation area is preserved and enhanced.

# IMPACT ON HERITAGE ASSETS

The impact of the original scheme on the significance of the building and the wider conservation area was originally considered to be unacceptable by the Building Conservation Officer. Following negotiations the scheme was amended to address many of the concerns raised and the issues raised by the Ecologist.

It is proposed to gain access to the building by the existing front door, construct a staircase to the lower ground floor where the majority of the bedroom accommodation is to be located, close off the side door at that level and create a mezzanine over roughly one third of the open chapel space to create a lounge with the open void above the rest of the chapel. Rooflights originally proposed are to be omitted, the render finish is to be retained, the mezzanine is to be set back from the windows and subject to conditions in respect of details, the Building Conservation Officer is now satisfied that the proposal is satisfactory in terms of the detail and in accordance with policies DMD8 and DMD12.

# AFFORDABLE HOUSING

Policy DMD22 is very clear that any new housing within Rural Settlements such as South Zeal should be aimed at providing affordable housing.

This building offers could offer the opportunity for two affordable dwellings – one on each floor with an existing entrance door available on the side for the lower ground floor and on the front for the ground floor. Each would be approx. 68sqm which is considered to be an appropriate size for a two bed single storey dwelling and this could be accommodated within the building with minimal disturbance of the internal fabric and character if an open plan layout were to be proposed on the ground floor.

The applicant has been asked to demonstrate whether such a conversion or an alternative community or employment use has been considered and in particular the viability reasons to support his proposal for a single unit. A development appraisal has been submitted setting out the costs and subsequent value of the open market dwelling. Interrogation of the figures submitted indicates a high specification but concludes that the cost of conversion would not be offset by the anticipated end value of the property.

A viability projection states that the cost of conversion to two units would be far greater than to one unit but this is based on an intensive conversion to achieve a four bed unit on the ground floor with a full mezzanine. Issues are also raised regarding insulation, fire separation and the installation of a heating system. Some details have been provided but in the absence of a costed scheme which is confirmed to meet building and fire regulations for a more sensitive conversion into two affordable units, it is not considered that the policy requirement in this regard has been sufficiently addressed.

Officers acknowledge that in terms of outside amenity space, storage of bins and parking, a scheme for two units will be more difficult to accommodate but this would need to be balanced against the benefits of achieving two units of affordable housing within the village, for which there is evidence of demand.

With respect to alternative uses, the applicant states that there are already three community halls/spaces within half a mile of the property, that running costs would be high and that in the absence of any parking a community use would generate issues of traffic and on street parking.

With respect to commercial use lack of parking and public transport are raised as issues. There are also vacant offices nearby.

# AMENITY

The neighbours to the south have expressed concerns regarding access and privacy. Their dwelling is more than 21m away and looks down onto the building. Although the introduction of a mezzanine has potential to enable additional overlooking of the neighbours land, the amended plans include the introduction of obscure glazing in the relevant window and the mezzanine to be set back from the windows. A condition can be imposed to ensure that the mezzanine is provided in accordance with the submitted plans and is retained in that position in perpetuity.

The applicant has submitted an outline construction management statement setting out how the construction phase of the project will be managed so as not to have significant impacts on

the environment and the local community. Compliance with a full construction management statement could be a condition of any planning permission.

# ECOLOGY

A bat and breeding survey report has been submitted and an initial building inspection found evidence of roosting pipistrelle and brown long eared bats in the roof together with nesting birds.

Revised drawings show that the roof space, will not now being affected and a revised report contains recommendations on this basis. This will ensure that the proposed work can proceed without the need for any protected species licence. The recommendations of the revised report should be a condition of any planning permission.

# PARKING

Although the Parish Council has unanimously supported the application, they have raised concerns regarding parking. Policy DMD40 would require two small units of accommodation to have 3 spaces, rather than 2 spaces for a detached dwelling which suggests that there would be likely to be more demand for on street parking. It should however be noted that there is a public car park very nearby and any visitors can park there.

# CONCLUSION

The applicant has addressed many of the conservation, amenity and ecology issues raised by officers. It is acknowledged that the detail of the scheme respects the integrity of the building and would not have an adverse impact on the Conservation Area or indeed the amenity of neighbouring residents. However, officers are not satisfied that the use of the building as one open market house is the optimum use of the building.

There is a clear conflict with policy (COR15, DMD22) in respect of the provision of affordable housing within a defined settlement. There are no overriding reasons to support a single open market dwelling in the face of a demonstrable need for affordable housing in this location. The applicant has failed to demonstrate that affordable housing cannot be provided or that alternative business or community uses have been fully explored at this time.

# NPA/DM/19/002

# DARTMOOR NATIONAL PARK AUTHORITY

# DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE

# 11 January 2019

# APPEALS

# Report of the Head of Development Management

<u>Recommendation :</u> That the report be noted.

The following appeal decision(s) have been received since the last meeting.

1	Application No:	W/18/3208625	District/Borough:	South Hams District
	Appeal Type:	Refusal of Full Planning Permission	Parish:	Ugborough
	Proposal:	Change of use and works to upper mezzanine floor in agricultural barn to security and manager's residential accommodation		
	Location:	Wrangaton Golf Course, To	rrs Barn, Leigh La	ine, Bittaford
	Appellant:	Mr D Barter		
	Decision:	DISMISSED		
2	Application No:	X/18/3201442	District/Borough:	South Hams District
	Appeal Type:	Refusal to issue a Certificate of Lawfulness	Parish:	Dean Prior
	Proposal:	Single storey extensions to rear and side		
	Location:	Weavers Cottage, Deancombe		
	Appellant:	Dr J Hedger		
	Decision:	DISMISSED		

The following appeal(s) have been lodged with the Secretary of State since the last meeting.

D/18/3215216	District/Borough:	West Devon Borough
Refusal of Full Planning Parish: Buckland Monachorum Permission - Householder		
Erection of extensions and alterations to existing dwelling		
Arundel, Harrowbeer Lane, Yelverton		
Mr & Mrs B Bennett		
	Refusal of Full Planning Permission - Householder Erection of extensions and <b>Arundel, Harrowbeer Lan</b>	Refusal of Full Planning Parish: Permission - Householder Erection of extensions and alterations to existin <b>Arundel, Harrowbeer Lane, Yelverton</b>

4 Application No:	W/18/3206330	District/Borough:	Teignbridge District
Appeal Type:	Refusal of Full Planning Permission	Parish:	Ashburton
Proposal:	Erection of agricultural build	ding for rare breed o	hicken farming (9m x 5m)

Location: Appellant:	land at Ausewell Common, Ashburton Ms V Siddell			
5 Application No:	W/18/3212179	District/Borough:	West Devon Borough	
Appeal Type:	Refusal of Full Planning Permission	Parish:	Dartmoor Forest	
Proposal:	Change of use and alterations to building and associated land from disused pumphouse to holiday let and curtilage			
Location:	Rendlestone Pumping Station, Princetown			
Appellant:	Miss C Riley			
6 Application No:	W/18/3213014	District/Borough:	South Hams District	
Appeal Type:	Refusal of Full Planning Permission - Householder	Parish:	South Brent	
Proposal:	Erection of single storey extension to side of dwelling			
Location:	ocation: Ashmead, Hillside, South Brent			
Appellant:	Mr B Evemy			
7 Application No:	W/18/3213287	District/Borough:	West Devon Borough	
Appeal Type:	Refusal of Full Planning Permission	Parish:	Dartmoor Forest	
Proposal: Location:	Erection of four dwellings with associated parking and external works			
	Land off Heather Terrace, Princetown			
Appellant:	Theorem Ltd			
8 Application No:	W/18/3215712	District/Borough:	West Devon Borough	
Appeal Type:	Refusal of Full Planning Permission	Parish:	Mary Tavy	
Proposal:	Agricultural barn (29m x 16m)			
Location:	Holditch Farm, Mary Ta∨y			
Appellant:	Mr M Venner			

**CHRISTOPHER HART**